Acclimation of Arabidopsis thaliana to long-term CO\textsubscript{2} enrichment and nitrogen supply is basically a matter of growth rate adjustment

Pierre Tocquin, Sandra Ormenese, Alexandra Pieltain, Nathalie Detry, Georges Bernier and Claire Périlleux

Laboratory of Plant Physiology, Department of Life Sciences, University of Liège, Sart-Tilman B22, 4000 Liège, Belgique

Abstract:

The long-term response of Arabidopsis thaliana to increasing CO\textsubscript{2} was evaluated in plants grown in 800 µl l\textsuperscript{-1} CO\textsubscript{2} from sowing and maintained, in hydroponics, on three nitrogen supplies: "low," "medium" and "high." The global response to high CO\textsubscript{2} and N-supply was evaluated by measuring growth parameters in parallel with photosynthetic activity, leaf carbohydrates, ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase (Rubisco) messenger RNA and protein, stomatal conductance (g\textsubscript{i}) and density. CO\textsubscript{2} enrichment was found to stimulate biomass production, whatever the N-supply. This stimulation was transient on low N-supply and persisted throughout the whole vegetative growth only in high N-supply. Acclimation on low N-high CO\textsubscript{2} was not associated with carbohydrate accumulation or with a strong reduction in Rubisco amount or activity. At high N-supply, growth stimulation by high CO\textsubscript{2} was mainly because of the acceleration of leaf production and expansion while other parameters such as specific leaf area, root/shoot ratio and g\textsubscript{i} appeared to be correlated with total leaf area. Our results thus suggest that, in strictly controlled and stable growing conditions, acclimation of A. thaliana to long-term CO\textsubscript{2} enrichment is mostly controlled by growth rate adjustment.

Abbreviations - A\textsubscript{sat}, assimilation rate at saturating irradiance; C\textsubscript{e}, external CO\textsubscript{2} concentration; C\textsubscript{i}, intercellular CO\textsubscript{2} concentration; FACE, free-air CO\textsubscript{2} enrichment; FW, fresh weight; g\textsubscript{i}, stomatal conductance; IRGA, infrared gas analyzer; mRNA, messenger RNA; NADPH, nicotinamide adenine dinucleotide phosphate; PGI, phosphoglucone isomerase; RBCL, Rubisco large subunit; RBCS, Rubisco small subunit; RH, relative humidity; R/S, root-to-shoot ratio; Rubisco, ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase; SD, stomatal density; SDS-PAGE, sodium dodecyl sulfate-polyacrylamide gel electrophoresis; SLA, specific leaf area; TLA, total leaf area; V\textsubscript{c,max}, maximum rate of carboxylation of Rubisco.

INTRODUCTION

Enrichment in atmospheric CO\textsubscript{2} is one of the main causes of the global climate change. Photosynthesis is a major target of the increasing CO\textsubscript{2}, well upstream of other plant responses. Indeed, at present CO\textsubscript{2} concentration (approximately 390 µl l\textsuperscript{-1}), C\textsubscript{3} photosynthesis is still limited by the competition between CO\textsubscript{2} and O\textsubscript{2} at the active site of the ribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase (Rubisco), which is involved in both photosynthesis and photorespiration. Any CO\textsubscript{2} increase should thus stimulate photosynthesis, improve assimilate production and plant growth. If this situation does indeed occur after short-term CO\textsubscript{2} enrichment (from seconds to days), the question of whether it is sustainable over the long term (days to months) or not remains open to discussion (Woodward 2002). Acclimation of photosynthesis is indeed frequently observed, which limits the potential benefit of the CO\textsubscript{2} increase (Moore et al. 1999). Several factors have been proposed to explain this phenomenon: repression of photosynthetic genes by carbohydrates (Krapp et al. 1993, Rolland et al. 2002), limitation by N-availability (Pottersson and McDonald 1994, Stitt and Krapp 1999), insufficient sink capacity (Paul and Foyer 2001), and accelerated leaf senescence (Ludewig and Sonnewald 2000). Accumulation of leaf carbohydrates was observed in a wide variety of plants grown in high CO\textsubscript{2} and has long been proposed to downregulate photosynthetic genes expression—particularly those encoding Rubisco (Van Oosten et al. 1994)—through a sugar-signaling pathway (Jang et al. 1997, Moore et al. 1999). However, this negative feedback might account for short-term response to high CO\textsubscript{2} only (Cheng et al. 1998), and has not been found in all cases (Geiger et al. 1999). Most interestingly, Sims et al. (1998) have reported that, in soybean (Glycine max), the photosynthetic capacity of a single leaf does not correlate with local leaf carbohydrate accumulation but with the CO\textsubscript{2} environment sensed by the whole organism. In the longer term, photosynthesis is controlled by a complex network of metabolic and hormonal signals (Paul and Foyer 2001). This allows the plant to balance photosynthesis according to endogenous parameters, such as the source to sink ratio, and not just to primary environmental parameters such as light and CO\textsubscript{2} (Paul and Foyer 2001, Stitt and Krapp 1999).

How plants respond to long-term CO\textsubscript{2} enrichment remains, however, unclear because photosynthesis is not the only process involved. High CO\textsubscript{2} was reported to cause a reduction in stomatal density in different plant species.
During the last decade, *Arabidopsis thaliana* received increasing interest in the field of global change evaluation. However, getting a comprehensive overview of its response to high CO₂ remains difficult because studies focused either on biochemical and molecular aspects of the photosynthetic response (Bae and Sicher 2004, Cheng et al. 1998, Signora et al. 1998) or on plant growth and development (Van der Kooij et al. 1999) but hardly integrated both aspects (Sun et al. 2002). At the biochemical and molecular level, prolonged exposure to elevated CO₂ was found to cause an increase in carbohydrate content, which consequently represses photosynthetic genes (Cheng et al. 1998, Sun et al. 2002). The capacity to use soluble carbohydrates, and so prevent their accumulation, was further proved to be essential for growth stimulation by high CO₂ because strong downregulation of photosynthesis was observed in mutants unable to store starch (Sun et al. 2002). At the whole-plant level, experiments with *A. thaliana* showed that shoot biomass is generally increased by rising CO₂. It is clear from this short survey that understanding plant response to high CO₂ will not be achieved unless molecular and organismic aspects are integrated and studied beyond photosynthesis. Furthermore, the fact that other environmental and nutrient factors interfere with plant response to elevated CO₂ imposes special care in experimental design and control of growing conditions. It is also crucial to control the developmental fate of the plants to ensure that growth responses are significantly recorded as direct effects of environmental treatments. Therefore, we took advantage of tools that we had previously designed for *Arabidopsis*: we used an hydroponic system to control the N-supply and sustain vegetative growth for a long time (Tocquin et al. 2003) and a gas exchange measurement device (Tocquin and Périlleux 2004) to integrate the different scales of the plant response to CO₂ from molecules to organism, from short term to long term.

**MATERIALS AND METHODS**

**Plant culture**

Plants of *A. thaliana* ecotype Columbia were grown in hydroponics, as previously described (Tocquin et al. 2003). Briefly, seeds were stratified for 3 days on wet filter paper at 2°C, then were sown individually on 0.65% agar-contain-ing plastic "seed-holders" that had been specifically designed and machined (Tocquin et al. 2003). Eight seed-holders were inserted in the cover of a 1-l black plastic contai ner filled with a nutrient sol ution contai ni ng 3.5 mM NO₃⁻. This concentration was determined as optimal for plant growth in ambient CO₂ conditions (Tocquin et al. 2003) and will be hereafter referred to as "1 N-supply." In the experiments reported here, plants even grew better on 1N than was previously reported, showing the significant improvement obtained with the machined seed-holders, that allow easier and faster root growth at the beginning of the culture (Tocquin et al. 2003). Two other N-supplies were tested: a 16-fold lower N-supply (220 μMNO₃⁻; "1/16N"), and a six-fold higher N-supply (21 mM NO₃⁻; "6N"). Based on previous experiments performed in similar growing conditions (Tocquin et al. 2003), we chose to renew the nutrient solution weekly from the third week of growth. This was shown to minimize the impact of nutrient uptake on the pH and the conductivity of the solution. We did not observe any sign of depletion nor toxicity during the whole experiments; plants looked green and healthy in all conditions.

Plants were grown in phytotronic Conviron cabinets, in 8-h photoperiod. The photon flux density was 120 μmol m⁻² s⁻¹ photosynthetically active radiations (Very High Output fluorescent tubes, Sylvania, Zaventem, Belgium); temperature was 20°C (day/night) and relative humidity (RH) was 70%. These conditions were selected because they are favorable to vegetative growth of the plants, hence allow to follow-up plants of *Arabidopsis* for a long time without developmental changes (Tocquin et al. 2003).

CO₂ level in the cabinets was recorded and controlled by an infrared gas analyzer (IRGA, WMA-3, PPSytems, Hitchin, UK), equipped with a set point controller (VISIREG+, MCC, Issoudun, France). The atmospheric CO₂ concentration was either ambient (±390 μl l⁻¹) or supplied at 800 μl l⁻¹ (elevated CO₂ conditions).

**Growth measurements**

Growth was evaluated by the regular sampling of six plants at least, randomly chosen in the growth cabinet, and the recording of leaf number, total leaf area (TLA) and shoot and root fresh weight (FW). Leaf number was the total number of leaves whose blade was longer than 3 mm. The projected leaf area was measured on a digital picture of intact rosettes, using an image analysis software (SigmaS-can Pro4, SPSS Inc., Chicago, IL); a scale was included in each picture for calibration. In the text, this measurement will be referred to as the TLA.
Shoot FW was recorded as the whole rosette biomass measured immediately after harvest. Root FW was measured after mopping up the whole root system with a filter paper. The root-to-shoot ratio (R/S) was calculated on individual plants. TLA and shoot FW were used to calculate, for individual plants, the specific leaf area (SLA), expressed in cm$^{-1}$ g$^{-1}$.

**Starch, sucrose, fructose and glucose determination**

For carbohydrate analyses, a minimum of six whole rosettes, randomly chosen in the growth cabinet, were harvested at the end of the daylight 8-h period. Each sample was extracted in duplicate. About 100 mg of leaf material ground in liquid N$_2$ was extracted three times in 500 µl 80% (v/v) ethanol at 70°C. The ethanol soluble fractions—containing “soluble carbohydrates”—were pooled, dried under vacuum and dissolved in 250 µl of distilled water. The ethanol insoluble residue—starch—was briefly dried under vacuum and homogenized in 800 µl of 0.1 M citrate buffer, pH 4.6. Starch was then solubilized by 1 h autoclaving. Starch, sucrose, fructose and glucose were assayed enzymatically in separate aliquots. Fructose, sucrose and starch were first converted to glucose by treatment with, respectively, phospho-glucose isomerase (PGI), β-fructosidase/PGI and amylol-glucosidase (all enzymes from Roche Diagnostics, Vilvoorde, Belgium). Glucose was then quantified based on the equimolar release of nicotinamide adenine dinucleotide phosphate (NADPH) by the reaction of glucose with hexokinase/glucose-6-phosphate dehydrogenase, in a reaction mixture containing 0.44 M triethanolamine pH 7.6, 5.8 mM MgSO$_4$, 0.3 mM NADP and 0.3 mM ATP. NADPH was subsequently detected by its fluorescence at 445 nm using a fluorimeter (Jones 1979).

**Gas exchanges measurements**

The gas exchange measurements were performed as described in Tocquin and Périlleux (2004) using a custom made cuvette enclosing the whole rosette. The cuvette was connected to a differential CO$_2$/H$_2$O IRGA (Ciras-1, PPSystems, Hitchin, UK) equipped with an automatic air supplier to control flow rate as well as CO$_2$ and H$_2$O partial pressures of the input air. All measurements were performed with plants grown in hydroponics in a phyto-tron under controlled air temperature (20°C) and humidity (70% RH). In these conditions, the leaf to air water vapor deficit in the cuvette was calculated to be 0.9-1.3 kPa (Tocquin and Pérrilleux 2004).

Saturating irradiance was estimated by recording CO$_2$ uptake under increasing irradiance, as previously described (Tocquin and Périlleux 2004). Because 1000 µmol m$^{-2}$s$^{-1}$ was found to saturate CO$_2$ assimilation ($A_{sat}$) in all experimental conditions used, it was selected to measure CO$_2$ uptake in response to variation in external CO$_2$ concentration ($C_i$). CO$_2$ assimilation by unit leaf area was then calculated using TLA as a reliable estimation of the photosynthetic area. It was indeed observed that leaf shading was <5% of total rosette area (Donahue et al. 1997, Sun et al. 1999, Tocquin and Périlleux 2004). Data shown are the mean of five measurements performed on three to five different plants, randomly sampled in the growth cabinet. Data collected by IRGA were used to calculate $A_{sat}$, intercellular CO$_2$ ($C_i$) and stomatal conductance ($g_s$) according to von Caemmerer and Farquhar (1981). $A_{sat}$ was plotted in response to increasing $C_i$, and maximum rate of carboxylation of Rubisco ($V_{c,max}$) was then calculated by fitting these data to model equations from von Caemmerer and Farquhar (1981) by the least squares method using Photosyn Assistant (Dundee Scientific, Dundee, UK).

**Rubisco messenger RNA and protein analyses**

For both messenger RNA (mRNA) and protein analyses, a minimum of six whole rosettes were randomly harvested at the onset of the light period and frozen in liquid N$_2$. RNA was extracted as described in Cremer et al. (1991). For Northern blot preparation, 20 µg of total RNA was subjected to electrophoresis on 1.2% formaldehyde-agarose gels and transferred by capillarity onto a Nylon membrane (HybondN 0.45 µm, GE Healthcare Europe GmbH, Diegem, Belgium) as described in Sambrook et al. (1989). RNA was bound to the membrane by cross-linking with ultraviolet (120 000 µm$^{-2}$, Fisher Bioblock Scientific, Tournai, Belgium). Probe labeling was performed with a RadPrime DNA Labeling System (Invitrogen, Belgium). Protocols for hybridization and washes of the Northern blots were as described by Amersham. Probes were synthesized by PCR on *A. thaliana* genomic DNA by using the following primers for the small Rubisco subunit (*RBCS*) 5'-CCTCTATGTCTCTCTTCGGCCTCTTCT-3' and 5'-ACAAATCCTCGTGCTCCTCAACTC-3', and for the large sub-unit (*RBCL*) 5'-TTCGGTGGGAGGAGACCACTT-3' and 5'-AAGAAGCAGGGGATATCTTTACCT-3'. PCR products were cloned and checked by sequencing.

Protein extraction was performed by homogenizing about 50 mg of leaf material in 750 µl extraction buffer (0.1 MTris-HCl pH 8.3, 0.5 M NaCl, 5 mM dithiothreitol, 5 mM ethylenediaminetetraacetic acid, 2 mM phenylmethylsulfonyl fluoride). Samples were incubated 1 h at 4°C with constant agitation. After centrifugation,
supernatant was collected and pellets were extracted once more. Supernatants were pooled and protein concentrations were determined using the Bradford protein assay (Bradford 1976). One hundred micrograms of proteins was precipitated in 10% trichloroacetic acid (w/v) and dissolved in 30 µl sodium dodecyl sulfate-polyacrylamide gel electrophoresis (SDS-PAGE) loading buffer. Twenty-five micrograms of proteins was loaded on SDS-PAGE and submitted to electrophoresis [1 h at 180 V in 0.75-mm running gel containing 15% (w/v) acrylamide]. Gels were then blotted onto a polyvinylidene difluoride membrane and the RBCS was detected with a rabbit anti-chicken IgY antibody from Agrisera (Vannas, Sweden) by using the BM chemiluminescence Western blotting kit from Roche Applied Science.

Stomatal imprints and stomatal density measurement

Leaves # 5 and 10 (numbered from oldest to youngest) were used for measurement. Leaves were taken off the plant and their abaxial face was covered with transparent nail varnish. After the imprint had air-dried, it was peeled off, laid on a glass slide and examined under a light microscope at 10x magnification. Stomata were counted in the field of the microscope. For each leaf, three microscope fields were examined in the larger part of the blade and mean values were calculated. Three plants were used to determine the mean number of stomata per unit leaf area (mm²). The leaf blade area was measured on individual leaves by using the same procedure described for the measurement of the TLA (see before).

RESULTS

Growth

Plants of A. thaliana were grown in ambient CO₂ (±390 µl l⁻¹) or high CO₂ (800 µl l⁻¹), on hydroponic solutions providing low (1/16N), medium (1 N) or high (6N) N-supplies. Other growing conditions were chosen to promote vegetative growth and so elongate the investigated period (see Materials and methods).

In a preliminary experiment, growth kinetic was recorded by frequent measurements (up to three times a week) of TLA. The exponential phase of rosette growth was found to start around the fourth week in all conditions (data not shown), hence we decided to further characterize 4- and 6-week-old plants, i.e. plants harvested at the beginning and during the exponential growth phase, respectively.

We observed on 4-week-old plants that high CO₂ led to a remarkable increase in shoot biomass (Fig. 1 A), whose magnitude increased with N-supply. However, after 6 weeks of growth, the stimulation was still detectable on high N only, while plants grown on low N no longer showed a positive effect of high CO₂ (Fig. 1 B). On the medium level of 1 N, the stimulation also decreased with time: the gain in biomass because of high CO₂ decreased from a 4.2-fold ratio in 4-week-old plants to a three-fold ratio in 6-week-old plants (Fig. 1 A, B).

These results suggested that the optimal N-supply was different in ambient or high CO₂: Fig. 1 indeed shows that in ambient CO₂ (black bars), the maximum shoot biomass accumulation was observed with the medium 1 N-supply while in high CO₂ (hatched bars), the optimum was higher.

The increase in shoot biomass observed in high CO₂ could be because of an increase in leaf number, TLA and/or SLA. We therefore recorded these parameters on 6-week-old plants. Consistent with our observation that the positive effect of high CO₂ was not visible any more on 1/16N, we observed no difference in leaf number or TLA as compared with control plants grown in ambient CO₂ (Fig. 1 C). In contrast, plants grown on 1 N or 6N still had more leaves and a higher TLA in high CO₂. As for the biomass production, the maximum effect of CO₂ enrichment was observed for 6N plants: TLA was fivefold higher and plants produced 50% more leaves in 800 µl l⁻¹ than in ambient CO₂. Moreover, under this high N-supply, CO₂ enrichment led to a modification of leaf morphology: their petiole was shorter and their blade was larger than in control plants. As compared with 1 N plants grown in 800 µl l⁻¹ CO₂, this particular trait of 6N plants resulted in an increase of TLA without significant increase in rosette diameter (Fig. 1 C).
**Fig. 1.** Shoot biomass of (A) 4-and (B) 6-week-old Arabidopsis plants grown in ambient (black bars) or elevated (800 µl l⁻¹) CO₂ (hatched bars). Plants were cultivated in hydroponics on low (1/16N), medium (1N) or high (6N) nitrogen supply. Numbers represent the relative increase of biomass in elevated vs ambient CO₂. Data are means ± standard deviation, ns, not statistically different.

Concerning SLA (cm² g⁻¹ FW), a significant decrease was observed with increasing CO₂, N-supply and plant age (Fig. 2 A). However, these differences were actually caused by TLA because a strong correlation was found between SLA and TLA, whatever the growing conditions (Fig. 2B): SLA decreased to a bottom value of 48 cm² g⁻¹ FW when TLA increased up to approximately 5 cm² and beyond.

Root biomass was even more increased than shoot growth by high CO₂: we observed that the R/S was higher in 800 µl l⁻¹ CO₂ than in ambient CO₂ (Fig. 2C, D). This effect was moderate in 1 N plants but more pronounced on 1/16N and 6N supplies. Although it was difficult from Fig. 2C, D to find any correlation between R/S and N-supply or plant age, a clear correlation again appeared when R/S was plotted against TLA: irrespective of the CO₂ concentration, R/S increased to a maximum value when TLA increased up to approximately 5 cm² and beyond (Fig. 2E). This maximum R/S value was different for each N-supply, being the lowest in 1 N plants and the highest in 1/16N plants (but not reached in our experimental conditions).

### Starch and soluble carbohydrates

Starch and soluble carbohydrates (glucose, fructose and sucrose) were analyzed in 4- and 6-week-old plants, in all CO₂- and N-supplies conditions (Fig. 3); material was harvested at the end of the 8-h light period.

Quite unexpectedly, CO₂ enrichment had very little effect on starch or soluble carbohydrates content of the rosettes. The only significant difference was observed on low N, where CO₂ enrichment actually caused a reduction in starch and soluble carbohydrate (Fig. 3). It is also noteworthy that, in ambient CO₂, these plants grown on 1/16N contained more sugars than those grown on higher N-supplies, especially after 6 weeks of growth, which suggest that their photosynthesis was in excess as compared with their growth (see below).

### Photosynthesis

The net CO₂ assimilation rate measured at the saturating irradiance of 1000 µmol m⁻² s⁻¹ (Aₘₐₓ) was recorded in all CO₂ and N-supplies conditions in response to variation in Cᵣ, from 0 to 1400 µl l⁻¹. From these assimilation curves, Vₐₙₐₓ of Rubisco was calculated as explained in Materials and methods.
Fig. 2. (A and B) Variation of the specific leaf area (SLA) of Arabidopsis plants with (A) CO\(_2\) level, N-supply and plant age and (B) total leaf area (TLA). Data shown in this figure are from 12 experimental batches (4-and 6-week-old plants grown in ambient or 800 \(\mu\)l l\(^{-1}\) CO\(_2\) and in 1/16N, 1N or 6N) of six plants each. These are the 12 experimental points in panel B (mean values; error bars were omitted for clarity). In panel A, data were clustered to show the effect of a single parameter on SLA. (C-E) Root-to-shoot ratio (R/S) of (C) 4- and (D) 6-week-old Arabidopsis plants grown in ambient (black bars) or elevated (800 \(\mu\)l l\(^{-1}\) CO\(_2\) (hatched bars). (E) Correlation between R/S and TLA for each N-supply. The 12 experimental points are identical to those of panels C and D (mean values; error bars were omitted for clarity). Plants were cultivated in hydroponics on low (1/16N), medium (1N) or high (6N) N-supply. In panels A, C and D, data are means ± standard deviation, ns, not statistically different; *statistically different at \(P \leq 0.05\); **statistically different at \(P \leq 0.001\). In panels B and E, circles, squares and triangles are, respectively, representing 1/16N, 1N and 6N plants. Open symbols are for ambient CO\(_2\) and filled symbols are for high CO\(_2\) conditions. The regression curves were calculated using SigmaPlot2001 (SPSS, Inc.).

To assess whether acclimation of photosynthesis to high CO\(_2\) occurred in our conditions, we compared \(A_{sat}\) measured on plants grown in ambient CO\(_2\) at a \(C_a\) of 400 \(\mu\)l l\(^{-1}\) (Fig. 4A, B, "amb/amb") to (1) \(A_{sat}\) measured on the same plants at a \(C_a\) of 800 \(\mu\)l l\(^{-1}\) (Fig. 4A, B, "amb/ elev")—which represents the short-term response to an instant doubling in CO\(_2\) (Fig. 4C, D, open bars)—and to (2) \(A_{sat}\) measured on plants grown in high CO\(_2\) at a \(C_a\) of 800 \(\mu\)l l\(^{-1}\) (Fig. 4A, B, "elev/elev"), which accounts for the long-term effect of CO\(_2\) enrichment on photosynthetic activity (Fig. 4C, D, hatched bars).

The short-term response of photosynthesis to CO\(_2\) enrichment (\(A_{sat}\) amb/elev vs \(A_{sat}\) amb/amb) was clearly a stimulation, in all N-supplies (Fig. 4A, B). The range of this stimulation (Fig. 4C, D, open bars) was about 50% for 4-week-old plants, whatever the N-supply, and slightly increased with N-supply for 6-week-old plants. These variations were found to correlate with the estimated \(V_{c,max}\) of ambient CO\(_2\) plants (Fig. 4E, F, black bars).
The long-term response of photosynthesis to elevated CO\textsubscript{2} (\(A_\text{sat}^\text{elev/elev}\ vs \ A_\text{sat}^\text{amb/amb}\)) also was a stimulation but only for plants grown on 1 N or 6N (Fig. 4A, B). As compared with plants kept in ambient conditions, the stimulation ranged from 50 to 100\% (Fig. 4C, D). On the contrary, when grown on 1/6N, plants in high CO\textsubscript{2} did not show a higher photosynthetic activity than plants grown in ambient CO\textsubscript{2}, hence photosynthesis had acclimated. When we compared long-term and short-term responses of photosynthesis to CO\textsubscript{2} (elev/elev vs amb/elev), we indeed observed that plants grown continuously in 1/6N and 800 \(\mu l\ l^{-1}\) CO\textsubscript{2} had completely lost the benefit of high CO\textsubscript{2}. On the contrary, plants grown on 1 N or 6N showed about the same photosynthetic activity in 800 \(\mu l\ l^{-1}\) CO\textsubscript{2}, whether they had been grown in high or ambient CO\textsubscript{2}. One exception was found for 4-week-old plants grown in 1N medium, which showed a stronger long-term stimulation than the short-term response (Fig. 4C, hatched vs open bars).

All together, the long-term response of photosynthesis to high CO\textsubscript{2} could not be explained by effects on the \(V_{\text{C,max}}\) of Rubisco (hatched bars in Fig. 4C, D vs Fig. 4E, F). We therefore further analyzed the Rubisco content of the plants.

**Rubisco**

The contribution of Rubisco to the photosynthetic response of plants to CO\textsubscript{2} and N-supplies was investigated by measuring the steady-state mRNA level of both Rubisco subunits (\textit{RBCL} and \textit{RBCS}) and the amount of the RBCS in 6-week-old plants.

Only weak differences in the steady-state amount of mRNA were found between experimental batches: we observed a slight increase in \textit{RBCL} mRNA with CO\textsubscript{2} level, and a slight decrease in \textit{RBCS} mRNA on the lowest N-supply (Fig. 5). The amount of RBCS protein correlated well with the mRNA level: no clear difference was found between CO\textsubscript{2} treatments but the amount of protein was lower in 1/6N plants as compared with other N-supplies.

**Stomatal conductance and density**

\(g_s\) was calculated from gas exchange measurements as explained in Materials and methods (Fig. 6). We observed on 4-week-old plants that individuals grown in high CO\textsubscript{2} had a lower \(g_s\) than plants grown in ambient CO\textsubscript{2} (Fig. 6A). However, this CO\textsubscript{2} effect persisted on 1/6N only in 6-week-old plants (Fig. 6B).

Stomata were counted on the abaxial face of leaves # 5 and 10 of 6-week-old plants and stomatal density (SD) was found to be remarkably stable, around 100 mm\textsuperscript{-2}, except on 1/6N where values were up to three times
higher (Fig. 6C, D). This difference reflects the impact of CO₂- and N-supplies on the growth rate of the plants because we found that—when leaves are fully expanded—a strong correlation exists between stomata number and leaf blade area, hence SD is a constant (Fig. 6E). Thus, the higher SD of 1/16N plants could be explained by their slow growing rates: at 6 weeks, leaf blades had not reached their full size, hence SD was not stabilized yet.

DISCUSSION

A commonly documented effect of CO₂ enrichment is the acclimation of photosynthesis, generally explained by a negative feedback through accumulating carbohydrates (Moore et al. 1999). This hypothesis is very attractive and it has been demonstrated that carbohydrates do indeed repress photosynthetic genes (Koch 1996, Krapp et al. 1993). However, this single process hardly explains all plant responses to high CO₂ whose understanding requires that whole plant growth and development, as well as interference with other environmental factors, are considered (see Introduction). The goal of our study was to obtain a comprehensive overview of long-term CO₂ enrichment by studying as many responses as possible in the same experiments, on the same material. We used the model plant Arabidopsis, but because this fast growing species has a short cycle, long-term experiments must be performed in strictly controlled conditions of light and temperature. Plants were cultivated in phytotronic cabinets, in hydroponics from sowing to adult vegetative size. CO₂ was either "ambient" (390 µl l⁻¹) or "elevated" (800 µl l⁻¹) and three different N-supplies were tested: "low" (1/16N), "medium" (1 N), and "high" (6N).
**Fig. 4.** Photosynthetic activity and maximum rate of carboxylation of Rubisco of (A, C, E) 4- and (B, D, F) 6-week-old plants of *Arabidopsis* grown in ambient (black bars) or elevated (800 µl l\(^{-1}\)) CO\(_2\) (hatched bars). Plants were grown in hydroponics on low (1/16N), medium (1N) or high (6N) nitrogen supply. CO\(_2\) assimilation at saturating irradiance was measured at the CO\(_2\) concentration of growth for ambient (“amb/amb,” black bars) and elevated CO\(_2\) plants (“elev/elev,” hatched bars), and after an instant doubling in CO\(_2\) level for plants grown in ambient conditions (“amb/elev,” open bars). Data are means ± standard deviation for three to five plants. The difference was evaluated using the t-test: statistically different at \(P \leq 0.001\) with the corresponding black bar (**) or white bar (°°) and not statistically different (ns).
CO₂ enrichment leads to long-term stimulation of growth if N-supply is not limiting

Biomass accumulation is the most obvious and easy parameter used to evaluate environmental effects on plant growth. As reported by others, we observed that growth is stimulated by high CO₂, especially when plants are grown under high N-supply, i.e. when N is not limiting (Fig. 1). In that respect, we have observed that the optimal N-supply is higher in high CO₂ than in ambient CO₂ and the most significant gain in biomass was observed for plants grown in 6N. This observation is in good agreement with the well-documented interaction between elevated CO₂ and nitrogen nutrition (Stitt and Krapp 1999). When N-supply was lower than 6N, we observed that growth stimulation by high CO₂ decreased in amplitude with time (on 1N), or disappeared (on 1/16N). This was not caused by medium depletion because the hydroponic solution was renewed weekly. Thus, the growth stimulation of *Arabidopsis* plants by elevated CO₂ is a time-dependent process closely linked to N-supply. As a consequence, plant response to high CO₂ can not be estimated by single biomass comparison, especially in long-term experiments.

The growth stimulation at elevated CO₂ results from an acceleration of leaf initiation and expansion

The increase in biomass under elevated atmospheric CO₂ has been reported to correlate to a decrease in SLA in many species (Long et al. 2004, Poorter and Pérez-Soba 2002, Woodward 2002), including *Arabidopsis* (Van der Kooij and DeKok 1996). This effect was often shown to result from an increase in non-structural carbohydrates and leaf thickness (Poorter and Navas 2003). N-limitation was also shown to reduce SLA through accumulation of carbohydrates that are not used for size increase (de Groot et al. 2002). In our study, we observed that SLA decreased with increasing CO₂ but also with increasing N-supply, and plant age (Fig. 2A). However, we found that this effect may be indirect because a strong correlation exists between SLA and TLA, whatever CO₂ and N conditions (Fig. 2B). This suggests that, in our growing conditions, the primary effect of CO₂ was to increase TLA and that the decrease in SLA secondarily correlated with this change. This conclusion is supported by the study of Gibeaut et al. (2001) who observed that growing *Arabidopsis* in elevated CO₂ led to a concomitant increase in relative growth rate and TLA while the SLA was only slightly reduced. They also showed that the activity of UDP-glucose dehydrogenase, a key enzyme in the cell-wall biosynthesis—and thus involved in cell and leaf elongation—was increased in elevated CO₂. Moreover, Taylor et al. (1994) showed that leaf expansion is stimulated by high CO₂ in several species, from trees to herbs.

Leaf expansion was not the only growth process stimulated by high CO₂: we observed an even more pronounced increase in root biomass (Fig. 2C, D). However, this again appeared as an indirect effect of CO₂ because the R/S ratio was found to follow TLA, irrespective of CO₂ conditions (Fig. 2E). Thus, at this stage, we may conclude that the main effect of CO₂ was to accelerate TLA increase, causing an ontogenic "shift" which correlates with
changes in SLA and R/S ratio.

**Acclimation of *A. thaliana* to long-term elevated CO$_2$ involves growth rate adjustments rather than a carbohydrate mediated repression of photosynthesis**

In our study, acclimation of photosynthesis in high CO$_2$ was observed under the most limiting N-supply only (1/16N) (Fig. 4A, B). The contribution of nitrogen deficiency in photosynthesis acclimation to elevated CO$_2$ has been widely reported in many plant species (Stitt and Krapp 1999), including *Arabidopsis* (Sun et al. 2002). In most cases, these non-optimal nutrient conditions led to an increase in non-structural carbohydrates, particularly starch in *Arabidopsis* (Cheng et al. 1998, Sun et al. 2002, Van der Kooij and DeKok 1996, Van der Kooij et al. 1999), and a concomitant decrease in Rubisco content. In our experimental conditions, N-limitation did correlate with an increase in starch and soluble carbohydrates, but CO$_2$ enrichment did not (Fig. 3). When grown on 1/16N, plants accumulated starch and sugars at ambient CO$_2$, but this did not cause a reduction in the photosynthetic activity of the plants as compared with plants grown on higher N-supplies (Fig. 4A, B). Plants grown on 1/16N contained slightly less Rubisco (Fig. 5) but this was compensated by a higher $g_s$ (Fig. 6). We conclude from this situation that carbohydrate accumulates in low N plants grown at ambient CO$_2$ because of insufficient sinks.

![Fig. 6.](image-url) (A, B) Stomatal conductance of (A) 4- and (B) 6-week-old plants of *Arabidopsis* grown in ambient (black bars) or elevated (800 µl l$^{-1}$) CO$_2$ (hatched bars). Data are means ± standard deviation for three to five plants. (C, D) Stomatal density (SD) on the abaxial face of leaves #5 (C) and 10 (D) of 6-week-old plants grown in ambient (black bars) or elevated (800 µl l$^{-1}$) CO$_2$ (hatched bars). Data are means ± standard deviation for a total of 30 measurements performed on three different leaves. Plants were grown in hydroponics on low (1/16N), medium (1N) or high (6N) N-supply. ns, not statistically different; *statistically different at $P \leq 0.05$; **statistically different at $P \leq 0.001$. (E) Correlation between SD and final blade area of expanded leaves. Circles, squares and triangles are, respectively, representing 1/16N, 1N and 6N plants. Open symbols are for ambient CO$_2$ conditions and filled symbols are for high CO$_2$ conditions. The regression curve was calculated using SigmaPlot2001 (SPSS, Inc.).

By contrast, enrichment in CO$_2$ did not cause any accumulation of carbohydrates, whatever the N-supply, and
did not change the levels of Rubisco transcripts, protein (Fig. 5) or capacity ($V_{\text{c,max}}$, Fig. 4) either. Photosynthesis control by a carbohydrate feedback could thus be involved in short-term response to high CO$_2$ only. Supporting this hypothesis, it was reported that, when *A. thaliana* plants are transferred to high CO$_2$ and/or different N-supply conditions (Cheng et al. 1998, Sun et al. 2002, Van der Kooij and DeKok 1996, Van der Kooij et al. 1999), short-term growth, Rubisco content and carbohydrate accumulation are affected to a greater extent than in long-term experiments (Cheng et al. 1998, Gibeaut et al. 2001, Ward and Strain 1997). On the other hand, when plants are exposed to high CO$_2$ throughout their life cycle, other controls are apparently set up at the whole plant level, which affects leaf growth and adjust the photosynthetic capacity to the source to sink balance (Griffin and Seemann 1996, Makino and Mae 1999, Paul and Foyer 2001). Interestingly, similar conclusions were drawn from a metaanalysis of free-air CO$_2$ enrichment (FACE) experiments: "loss of Rubisco in FACE is more appropriately described as an acclimatory change benefiting N use efficiency rather than as downregulation" (Long et al. 2004). Although FACE experiments were designed to avoid some of the constraints of chamber studies, such as root containment, nutrient control and light quality, long-term culture in controlled chambers remains a method of choice for in-depth analysis of the mechanisms involved in the response to elevated CO$_2$. Such studies must be performed in stable environments, otherwise "short-term responses" maybe misleadingly generalized. In conclusion, the results presented here support the idea that plants of *Arabidopsis* respond to long-term CO$_2$ enrichment mainly by adjusting their growth rate. We observed that shoot biomass was higher under high CO$_2$ when growth was not limited by N-supply. We also showed that changes in SLA, R/S or SD—which are sometimes attributed to CO$_2$ concentration—actually reflect developmental variations because they are closely related to TLA, irrespective of CO$_2$ conditions. Only with limiting N was photosynthesis acclimation observed but independently of carbohydrate accumulation and Rubisco decrease. The repression of Rubisco through a carbohydrate-signaling pathway does not seem to control plant response to CO$_2$ in our experimental conditions.

Acknowledgements

P. Tocquin is grateful to the F.R.I.A. for the award of research fellowships. This research was supported by grants from the "Action de Recherches Concertées" 98/03-219 of the University of Liège and the Interuniversity Poles of Attraction Programme (Belgian State, Prime Minister's Office—Federal Office for Scientific, Technical and Cultural Affairs; P4/15, P5/13). Specific tools were developed with fundings from the Fonds National de la Recherche Scientifique (F.R.F.C. n°2.4510.02 & Crédit aux Chercheurs) and the University of Liège (Fonds Spéciaux).

References


Gibeaut DM, Cramer GR, Seemann JR (2001) Growth, cell walls, and UDP-Glc dehydrogenase activity of


Sun JD, Okita TW, Edwards GE (1999) Modification of carbon partitioning, photosynthetic capacity, and O2


Interactions of nitrate and CO$_2$ enrichment on growth, carbohydrates, and rubisco in Arabidopsis starch mutants. Significance of starch and hexose. Plant Physiol 130: 1573-1583


Van Oosten J-J, Wilkins D, Besford RT (1994) Regulation of the expression of photosynthetic nuclear genes by CO$_2$ is mimicked by regulation by carbohydrates: a mechanism for the acclimatization of photosynthesis to CO$_2$? Plant Cell Environ 17: 913-923


