



---

Review

Reviewed Work(s): *Geschichte Belgiens* by Henri Pirenne and Fritz Arnheim

Review by: Ruth Putnam

Source: *The American Historical Review*, Vol. 8, No. 2 (Jan., 1903), pp. 340-341

Published by: Oxford University Press on behalf of the American Historical Association

Stable URL: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/1832935>

Accessed: 07-05-2025 12:36 UTC

---

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <https://about.jstor.org/terms>



*Oxford University Press, American Historical Association* are collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The American Historical Review*

*Geschichte Belgiens.* Von HENRI PIRENNE. Uebersetzung der französischen Manuscripte von FRITZ ARNHEIM. Band II. Bis zum Tode Karls des Kühnes (1477). (Gotha: Perthes. 1902. Pp. xxviii, 594.)

AN author obliged to submit to the disadvantage of having his work appear in a foreign tongue before it is known in the original is greatly to be congratulated that a translation is as satisfactory as this of the second volume of Pirenne's history of Belgium, which like the first is published in a German setting made from the French manuscript. In this shape it forms the thirtieth work in the great series entitled *Geschichte der europäischen Staaten* edited by Heeren, Akert, von Giesebrecht, and Lamprecht. Now that the first volume is out in French it is possible to compare Pirenne's style with Arnheim's rendering of his substance. Naturally the balance is in favor of the former. There is a vivacity, a fluency, a lightness of touch in that, lost or overshadowed in the heavier German. But it must be conceded that the difficult task is well done and that the translator has been faithful without showing too great servility in using verbal equivalents where in German the thought naturally fell into other terms. This is fortunate for the author's reputation, because it is probable that the series will carry the translation with it into many quarters where the isolated *Histoire de Belgique* will not penetrate.

Volume II. opens with a study of the political situation in the Netherlands just before the outbreak of the Hundred Years' War (1337) and ends with an exposition of political and social conditions after the death of Charles the Bold. The treatment is somewhat less original than that of the matter discussed in Volume I., when Pirenne wished to urge a definite thesis and to trace his own theories of the essential unity in the development of the southern Netherland province as the meeting ground of Gallic and Teutonic civilization. Belgium was, in his opinion, a "microcosm" of western Europe, wherein could be observed the web of French and German influence. His manner of defending this thesis has brought upon him the charge of being too Flemish in his sympathies. Funck-Brentano sighs for a competent Walloon to combat Pirenne's assertion of Flemish preponderance in the making of the new nation. Again it is said that he underestimates the influence of the Church. But, in the main, critics and fellow-scholars have applauded his conclusions, and thought that he has skilfully deduced the essential history of Belgium as existent apart from Germany and France and shown that the little land has not been the plaything of chance in its growth. In this later period there is less to be argued, and controversy plays a slighter part, though the one theme of the growth of the national germ is constantly kept in view.

Owing to the impossibility of comprehending the rise of the Burgundian states without a knowledge of the political and diplomatic events accompanying its growth, the author has given more space to political history than in his early chapters. In a portion of this chronicle he has

availed himself of the work of other authors, such as the delightful *Le Siècle des Artevelles* of Vanderkindere and the *Essai sur le Rôle Politique et Social des Ducs de Bourgogne dans les Pays-Bas* of Paul Frederique, while he touches but lightly on the story of the northern provinces of the Netherlands, leaving that to his Holland colleague, Professor Blok. It is, however, just this political story, necessarily a condensed narrative, that makes this volume less individual in its effect than its predecessor. Condensed history is always hard reading, and it would be easier to take each section in an elaborated form as indicated by the references.

But in a chapter like that on the city in the fourteenth century Pirenne is at his best. In her municipal evolution, as in other processes of development, he regards Belgium as the experiment field for Europe, and his interest is therefore apart from local considerations. His own studies on various phases of this subject have been detailed, as can be seen in such articles of his as "L'Origine des Constitutions Urbaines, au Moyen Âge," "La Hanse Flamande de Londres," and others, and he must command a hearing even if all his conclusions be not accepted, as for instance, the municipal origin in the merchant community.

The exclusion of all details of purely local importance gives direct force to the argument, but also paints the text with a somber tint. In sum, it may be said that the best gift offered by the Ghent professor is bibliographical. This volume has a peculiar value as a splendid pathfinder to various phases of the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries as they can be seen in the Netherlands. With this and his new edition of the *Bibliographie de l'Histoire de Belgique* Pirenne has rendered great service to students.

RUTH PUTNAM.

*La Lettre et La Carte de Toscanelli sur la Route des Indes par l'Ouest.* Addressées en 1474 au Portugais Fernam Martins et Transmise plus tard à Christophe Colomb. Étude Critique sur l'Authenticité et la Valeur de ces Documents et sur les Sources des Idées Cosmographiques de Colomb suivie des Divers Textes de la Lettre de 1474 avec Traductions, Annotations et Facsimilé. Par HENRY VIGNAUD, Premier Secrétaire de l'Ambassade des Etats-Unis, Vice-Président de la Société des Americanistes de Paris, etc. (Paris: Ernest Leroux, Editeur. 1901. Pp. xxvi, 319.)

*Toscanelli and Columbus:* (Then follows as sub-title a translation of the above). (New York: E. P. Dutton and Co.; London: Sands and Co. 1902. Pp. xix, 365.)

*La Solution de Tous Les Problèmes Relatifs à Christophe Colomb et, en Particulier, de celui des Origines ou des Prétendus Inspirateurs de la Découverte du Nouveau Monde.* Par M. GONZALEZ DE LA ROSA, Membre de la Société des Americanistes de