

silvia groaz
new brutalism
the invention
of a style

EPFL Press

TREATISE ON CONCRETE

The graphical layout of the book and the cover design are by Paola Ranzini Pallavicini of Studio Pagina Milan, Italy. The photolithographic services were provided by Walter Bassani, Milan Italy.

EPFL PRESS

The EPFL Press is the English language imprint of the Foundation of the Presses polytechniques et universitaires romandes (PPUR). The PPUR publishes mainly works of teaching and research of the Ecole polytechnique fédérale de Lausanne (EPFL), of universities and other institutions of higher education.

Presses polytechniques
et universitaires romandes
EPFL – Rolex Learning Center
CM Station 10
CH-1015 Lausanne, Switzerland
E-mail: info@epflpress.org
Phone: +41 (0)21 693 21 30

www.epflpress.org

© 2023, first edition, EPFL Press
ISBN 978-2-88915-510-1 (EPFL Press)
Printed in Czech Republic

All rights reserved, including those of translation into other languages. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form – by photoprint, microfilm, or any other means – nor transmitted or translated into a machine language without written permission from the publisher.

EPFL

The publisher and author express their thanks to the École polytechnique fédérale de Lausanne (EPFL) and the Faculté de l'environnement naturel, architectural et construit (ENAC) for their generous support towards the publication of this book.

Treatise on Concrete

Directed by Roberto Gargiani

The volumes of the *Treatise on Concrete* intend to offer a new and documented vision of the evolution of construction techniques and of the creative potential and formal expressions of concrete, from antiquity to the present time. Each book in the series is based on specific archival research; the analysis of scientific, technical and iconographic original sources; and the investigation into documents made available by companies, engineers, architects and artists. The full spectrum of the use of concrete is covered, including the building of foundations, ports, moles, bridges, vaults, domes, fortresses, bunkers, houses and monuments, as well as the manufacture of artificial stones and sculptures. In addition, the volumes will address the theoretical issues of *béton brut*, Brutalism and the true nature of matter. All volumes focus on the techniques and materials for the manufacture of formwork, from wood to fabric; on the meaning of the imprint; on the surface processing of concrete by hand or with machine; and on the composition of the mixture.

The series of books aims to provide the scientific community with an unique and updated reference on the historical and contemporary uses of concrete, which will open a new chapter in the knowledge of this crucial material for architectural construction, as well as for masterpieces of engineering and art.

Volumes published:

Concrete, From Archeology to Invention, 1700-1769

Louis I. Kahn, Exposed Concrete and Hollow Stones, 1949-1959

Louis I. Kahn, Towards the Zero Degree of Concrete, 1960-1974

The Rhetoric of Pier Luigi Nervi, Concrete and Ferrocement Forms

German Concrete, The Science of Cement from Trass to Portland, 1819-1877

A New Era of American Architectural Concrete: From Wright to SOM

Aux 'messieurs de la plume'

Acknowledgement

This book would not have been possible without the support of Prof. Roberto Gargiani, his decisive and insightful guidance, and his time and thinking.

For the financial support of my research at various stages, I am grateful to EPFL and its excellent research framework, the Swiss National Science Foundation and the Getty Research Institute.

This research required the exploration of archival holdings and architectural journals. I would like to thank the staff of the various archives: Gudrun Krämer, Krämer Verlag; Shelley Hayreh, Avery Archives, Columbia University; Sarah Sherman, Getty Research Institute; Mari Nakahara, Library of Congress; Martin Klingbacher, Atelier 5 Archive; Ines Zalduendo, Frances Loeb Library, Harvard University; and Jennifer Garland, McGill University Archive.

My heartfelt thanks for their support and help go to the librarians of EPFL Library, especially Chantal Blanc, Catherine Sénéchaud, Jérôme Yerly, Anil Goolaub, Julien Tanari and Thomas von Allmen.

I would also like to express my gratitude to Kenneth Frampton, Denise Scott Brown and Robin Middleton for their precious insights and memories.

As well as Stanislaus von Moos, Mary McLeod, Paolo Scrivano, Laurent Stalder and Nicola Braghieri for their valuable guidance and critical feedback.

I am grateful to EPFL Press for their support in guiding me through the publication process and to Jo Nicoud-Garden for re-reading my manuscript.

Table of Contents

13	A Game of Patience for a New Art History – Roberto Gargiani	115	Chapter five. Critical Precisions: from Summerson to Lasdun
17	Chapter One. The British Debate in Search of a New-ism	115	The Old Rigour according to Summerson
17	Reactions to the International Style and the Myth of the Pioneers of the Modern Movement	119	Le Corbusier's Brutal Concrete, from Zevi to Scully
20	Principles of Truth: The Revival of Pugin, Ruskin and Morris	125	The Strict-Brutalists
22	Roughness, Accident and Irregularity for a New Picturesque	129	Thoughts in Progress on the Brutalist Canon
24	New Humanism, New Empiricism, New Monumentality	131	The Smithsons' Ethics
31	The Functional Tradition for National Unification	133	Style and Attitude
32	The Neo-Palladianism of Wittkower and Rowe		
37	Chapter Two. Le Corbusier and Béton Brut	137	Chapter six. International Brutalism: from Zevi to Joedicke
37	From 'Béton armé' to 'Béton brut' at the Unité in Marseille	137	Zevi and the First Italian Brutalist
39	<i>Architecture d'Aujourd'hui</i> and Art Brut	143	Romantic, Informal, Naturalistic: Italian Variations
41	<i>Le Point</i> and the Concept of Béton Brut	150	Premises for American Brutalism
44	The Humanism of Béton Brut	153	The Carnegie Institute Student Questionnaire
		157	Kallmann's Action Architecture
49	Chapter Three. The Invention of a Definition: from Asplund to the Smithsons	160	Directions and Dilemmas beyond the International Style
49	The First Brutalist Building: Villa Göth	167	Pevsner and Stirling vs. the Brutalist Aesthetics
52	The Unité as a Model for English Reconstruction	175	The Essential Ethic of Brutalism Is in Town Building
56	New Movement-Classical-Complex-Human	177	Anti-Miesian Brutalism by Pehnt and Joedicke
63	The Smithsons' New Brutalism		
69	Early Definitions of New Brutalism: Segal and the English Magazines	187	Chapter Seven. <i>The New Brutalism: Ethic or Aesthetic?</i> by Joedicke and Banham
75	Johnson's Anti-Design	187	Joedicke's Proposal for a Monograph on New Brutalism
77	Banham's Radical Philosophy	192	Towards the Final Structure of the Book
79	Formalism, Roughness and Brutality	196	Banham's New Brutalism: From Materials to Ethics
82	Smithsons' Anti-Art Architecture for a New Aesthetic	201	Beyond Brutalism: 'The Total Environment'
83	New Brutalism Will Take Many Forms	205	Brutalist Style
86	The Case of the School at Hunstanton	210	The Economist Building vs. Leicester University
88	Piranesi and Mies in Blake's New Brutalism		
91	Futurist Connections for a 'Mechanistic Brutalism'	215	Chapter Eight. The Sad End of New Brutalism
92	Stirling and the Primitive Aesthetics, or the Maisons Jaoul Model	215	Pevsner and the Anti-Pioneers
		218	New Brutalism's Obituary
97	Chapter Four. Banham's Memorable Article	221	The Old Brutalism
97	A Category of the New Art History	223	The Smithsons' Answer to Banham: Robin Hood Gardens
101	The Origins in Le Corbusier's Béton Brut		
103	Early Brutalism	233	Bibliography: Primary Sources
105	Anti-art and As Found: For 'une Architecture Autre'	253	Bibliography: Secondary Sources
106	Wittkower, Rowe and the Anti-Brutalists		
107	The Role of the Yale Art Gallery		
109	Image, ' <i>Quod Visum Perturbat</i> '		

Treatise on Concrete

Directed by Roberto Gargiani

New Brutalism

The Invention of a Style

The concept of New Brutalism has fallen victim to a series of misunderstandings, myths and aporias. The original definition was manipulated, diluted, and finally fragmented. Even today, discussions on New Brutalism are pervaded by ambiguity, confirming the need for a thorough reconstruction of its trajectory. By challenging its current categorization, this book recounts the critical debate around New Brutalism through its many actors, philological incongruities and heroic visions.

New Brutalism emerged in the 1950s as a rebellious response by the younger generation of architects, who infused architecture with popular culture, multidisciplinary influences and a call for reality based on “truth to materials”. It reflected the post-war period’s aspirations and anxieties, revealing the uncertainties of a rapidly changing society. War, reconstruction, mass consumer goods and the ‘atomic age’ became episodes that were translated into several perspectives, radically renewing the notion of architecture. At the heart of this renewal was the debate on New Brutalism, fuelled by the works of architects but above all by the aspirations of critics.

The central core of the book follows the ways New Brutalism was conceptualized – and exploited – by various international protagonists. Its trajectory is double-sided, not only because of the dual identity of New Brutalism and Brutalism, but also because it simultaneously encompasses both the affirmation of ethical and universal values and the pursuit of an aesthetic ideal. Of the exposed-concrete phenomenon of the 1960s, New Brutalism is both the promoter and the victim, caught between the verification of ethical principles and a repetitive obsession with surface finish.

What can we take from the trajectory of New Brutalism and from Reyner Banham’s dilemma between ethics and aesthetics that would accompany it until its ‘sad end’? Ironical, polemical, revolutionary and at times even Dadaist, New Brutalism opened a debate to renew the cultural trajectory of the Modern Movement. Its critical revision steered architecture onto a new course, admitting notions of ‘process’, ‘as found’ and ‘relations’ into the design project. Amongst the intricacies of the debate, we can glimpse the proposal for generative principles integrating a new awareness of flows and technology, intercepting the aspirations of a democratic society, against the backdrop of the search for a visionary synthesis of art, architecture, and urban design.

Silvia Groaz is an architectural historian and curator. She obtained her PhD from EPFL in 2021 and her MA in Architectural History from the Bartlett School of Architecture (UCL). Her research was granted by the Swiss National Science Foundation (SNSF), The Getty Research Institute, the Swiss Institute in Milan, and the Université Catholique de Louvain. She has been a Visiting Scholar at Columbia University and is currently a SNSF postdoctoral fellow between the Université Catholique de Louvain and Yale University.

