The pivotal role of entropy in the development of compressible Computational Fluid Dynamics algorithms

Carnot 2024 - Belgian Symposium on Thermodynamics

Liège, 16 december 2024





Koen Hillewaert (koen.hillewaert@uliege.be) ULiège, Aerospace & Mechanics, DoTP¹; Cenaero²; TU Department VKI ³

A. Bilocq¹, M. Borbouse¹, M. Boxho², N. Deneffe¹,
 S. Lavagnoli³, G. Lopes³, M. Rasquin², M. Thys¹, T. Toulorge²



Context High-resolution CFD for turbomachinery Entropy in fluid dynamics Navier-Stokes equations Irreversibility Shocks Take-away messages Entropy in mathematics Conservative equations Mathematical entropy Take-away messages Numerical methods Transonic CFD Finite Volume Method (FVM) Discontinuous Galerkin Method (DGM) Take-away messages DG shock capturing for DNS and LES Methods Compressible homogeneous isotropic turbulence Conclusions



Entropy in CFD algorithms

Context High-resolution CFD for turbomachinery

Turbulence paramount in turbomachinery

- large range of scales, smallest <<< geometry
- high loaded machinery often transonic
- conditions often between laminar and turbulent
- important source of losses/entropy
- beneficial for operational range

Turbulence models far from comfort zone

- very complex secondary flows
- ullet often transition \sim low Re, high acceleration
- interaction with shocks and shocklets
- transition, production, dissipation ... ~ vorticity and acoustics

Need for detailed turbulence budgets (DNS, LES) Challenges:

- (shock) stabilisation \leftrightarrow capturing turbulence
- importance of acoustic waves / effects



DNS of Spleen LPT cascade + wake generator experiment (Courtesy VKI and Cenaero) $\hfill \hfill \$

Entropy generation and transport through cascade



Context High-resolution CFD for turbomachinery

Turbulence paramount in turbomachinery

- large range of scales, smallest <<< geometry
- high loaded machinery often transonic
- conditions often between laminar and turbulent
- important source of losses/entropy
- beneficial for operational range

Turbulence models far from comfort zone

- very complex secondary flows
- ullet often transition \sim low Re, high acceleration
- interaction with shocks and shocklets
- transition, production, dissipation ... ~ vorticity and acoustics

Need for detailed turbulence budgets (DNS, LES) Challenges:

- (shock) stabilisation \leftrightarrow capturing turbulence
- importance of acoustic waves / effects



DNS of Speen LPT cascade + wake generator experiment (Courtesy VKI and Cenaero)
Density gradient troughout the cascade



Context High-resolution CFD for turbomachinery

Turbulence paramount in turbomachinery

- large range of scales, smallest <<< geometry
- high loaded machinery often transonic
- conditions often between laminar and turbulent
- important source of losses/entropy
- beneficial for operational range

Turbulence models far from comfort zone

- very complex secondary flows
- ullet often transition \sim low Re, high acceleration
- interaction with shocks and shocklets
- transition, production, dissipation ... ~ vorticity and acoustics

Need for detailed turbulence budgets (DNS, LES) Challenges:

- (shock) stabilisation \leftrightarrow capturing turbulence
- importance of acoustic waves / effects



DNS of Speen LPT cascade + wake generator experiment (Courtesy VKI and Cenaero)

Density gradient near the wake generator



Conservation applied to volume moving with the flow

• mass conservation

$$\frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{dt}}\int_V \rho \, dV = 0$$





Conservation applied to volume moving with the flow

• mass conservation

$$\int_{V} \frac{\partial \rho}{\partial t} \, dV + \oint_{\partial V} \rho \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{n} \, dS = 0$$





Conservation applied to volume moving with the flow

• mass conservation

$$\int_{V} \frac{\partial \rho}{\partial t} \, dV + \oint_{\partial V} \rho \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{n} \, dS = 0$$

• Newton's second law: change of momentum = force

$$\frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{dt}} \int_{V} \rho \mathbf{v} \, dV = \oint_{\partial V} -\rho \mathbf{n} \, dS + \oint_{\partial V} \mathbf{\tau} \cdot \mathbf{n} \, dS$$





Conservation applied to volume moving with the flow

• mass conservation

$$\int_{V} \frac{\partial \rho}{\partial t} \, dV + \oint_{\partial V} \rho \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{n} \, dS = 0$$

• Newton's second law: change of momentum = force

$$\int_{V} \frac{\partial \rho \mathbf{v}}{\partial t} \, dV + \oint_{\partial V} (\rho \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{n}) \, \mathbf{v} \, dS + \oint_{\partial V} \rho \mathbf{n} \, dS = \oint_{\partial V} \boldsymbol{\tau} \cdot \mathbf{n} \, dS$$





Conservation applied to volume moving with the flow

mass conservation

$$\int_{V} \frac{\partial \rho}{\partial t} \, dV + \oint_{\partial V} \rho \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{n} \, dS = 0$$

• Newton's second law: change of momentum = force

$$\int_{V} \frac{\partial \rho \mathbf{v}}{\partial t} \, dV + \oint_{\partial V} (\rho \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{n}) \, \mathbf{v} \, dS + \oint_{\partial V} \rho \mathbf{n} \, dS = \oint_{\partial V} \boldsymbol{\tau} \cdot \mathbf{n} \, dS$$

$$\frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{dt}} \int_{V} \rho E \, dV = \oint_{\partial V} -\rho \mathbf{v} \mathbf{n} \, dS + \oint_{\partial V} \mathbf{v} \cdot \boldsymbol{\tau} \cdot \mathbf{n} \, dS + \oint_{\partial V} \mathbf{q} \cdot \mathbf{n} \, dS$$





Conservation applied to volume moving with the flow

• mass conservation

$$\int_{V} \frac{\partial \rho}{\partial t} \, dV + \oint_{\partial V} \rho \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{n} \, dS = 0$$

• Newton's second law: change of momentum = force

$$\int_{V} \frac{\partial \rho \mathbf{v}}{\partial t} \, dV + \oint_{\partial V} (\rho \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{n}) \, \mathbf{v} \, dS + \oint_{\partial V} \rho \mathbf{n} \, dS = \oint_{\partial V} \boldsymbol{\tau} \cdot \mathbf{n} \, dS$$

$$\int_{V} \frac{\partial \rho E}{\partial t} \, dV + \oint_{\partial V} \left(\rho \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{n} \right) E \, dV = \underbrace{\oint_{\partial V} -\rho \mathbf{v} \mathbf{n} \, dS}_{\mathcal{W}_{\rho}} + \oint_{\partial V} \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{\tau} \cdot \mathbf{n} \, dS + \oint_{\partial V} \mathbf{q} \cdot \mathbf{n} \, dS$$





Conservation applied to volume moving with the flow

mass conservation

$$\int_{V} \frac{\partial \rho}{\partial t} \, dV + \oint_{\partial V} \rho \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{n} \, dS = 0$$

• Newton's second law: change of momentum = force

$$\int_{V} \frac{\partial \rho \mathbf{v}}{\partial t} \, dV + \oint_{\partial V} (\rho \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{n}) \, \mathbf{v} \, dS + \oint_{\partial V} \rho \mathbf{n} \, dS = \oint_{\partial V} \boldsymbol{\tau} \cdot \mathbf{n} \, dS$$

$$\int_{V} \frac{\partial \rho E}{\partial t} \, dV + \oint_{\partial V} \left(\rho \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{n} \right) \underbrace{\left(E + \frac{p}{\rho} \right)}_{H} \, dS = \oint_{\partial V} \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{\tau} \cdot \mathbf{n} \, dS + \oint_{\partial V} \mathbf{q} \cdot \mathbf{n} \, dS$$





Conservation applied to volume moving with the flow

mass conservation

$$\frac{\partial \rho}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot \rho \mathbf{v} = \mathbf{0}$$

• Newton's second law: change of momentum = force

$$\frac{\partial \rho \mathbf{v}}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot \rho \mathbf{v} \mathbf{v} + \nabla p = \nabla \cdot \boldsymbol{\tau}$$

$$\frac{\partial \rho E}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot \rho \mathbf{v} H = \nabla \cdot \mathbf{v} \cdot \boldsymbol{\tau} + \nabla \cdot \boldsymbol{q}$$





Entropy in fluid dynamics Irreversibility - mechanical energy





Entropy in fluid dynamics Irreversibility - entropy

Subtract mechanical energy from total energy equation \rightarrow conservation of internal energy

$$\frac{\partial \rho E}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot (\rho \mathbf{v} E + \rho \mathbf{v}) = \nabla \cdot \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{\tau} + \nabla \cdot \mathbf{q}$$
$$\frac{\partial \rho \mathcal{E}_k}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot (\rho \mathbf{v} \mathcal{E}_k + \rho \mathbf{v}) = \nabla \cdot \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{\tau} + \rho \nabla \cdot \mathbf{v} - \mathbf{\tau} : \nabla \mathbf{v}$$

$$rac{\partial
ho e}{\partial t} +
abla \cdot
ho oldsymbol{v} e = - oldsymbol{p}
abla \cdot oldsymbol{v} + oldsymbol{ au} :
abla oldsymbol{v} +
abla \cdot oldsymbol{q}$$

Conservation equation for entropy *density*

$$\frac{\partial \rho s}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot \rho \boldsymbol{v} \boldsymbol{s} = \frac{1}{T} \left(\underbrace{\boldsymbol{\tau} : \nabla \boldsymbol{v}}_{dq_{irr}} + \underbrace{\nabla \cdot \boldsymbol{q}}_{dq_{rev}} \right)$$





LES of the VKI LS89 high-pressure turbine inlet guide vane, condition MUR235 Numerical schlieren and wall heat flux (courtesy Cenaero and VKI)



Entropy in CFD algorithms



• second law $s_2 > s_1$

 $(p_1, T_1, v_1) \rightarrow (p_2, T_2, v_2)$







• conservation of mass, momentum and energy

 $(p_1, T_1, v_1) \leftrightarrow (p_2, T_2, v_2)$

• second law $s_2 > s_1$

 $(p_1, T_1, v_1) \rightarrow (p_2, T_2, v_2)$







• conservation of mass, momentum and energy

 $(p_1, T_1, v_1) \leftrightarrow (p_2, T_2, v_2)$

• second law $s_2 > s_1$

 $(p_1, T_1, v_1) \to (p_2, T_2, v_2)$







• conservation of mass, momentum and energy

 $(p_1, T_1, v_1) \leftrightarrow (p_2, T_2, v_2)$

• second law $s_2 > s_1$

 $(p_1, T_1, v_1) \to (p_2, T_2, v_2)$



Effect of viscosity on dissipation ${m au}:
abla {m
u}$

- ${\ensuremath{\, \bullet }}$ shock thickness depends on μ
- Δs independent
- Euler = vanishing viscosity solution



Thermodynamic conservation equations

- embedded in the Navier-Stokes equations
 - total enthalpy
 - static enthalpy: follows from the change from Lagrangian to Eulerian frame
 - mechanical energy: follows from calculating work along a stream line
 - internal energy/entropy: total energy mechanical energy
 - irreversibility: positivity of $\boldsymbol{\tau}: \nabla \boldsymbol{v}$



Thermodynamic conservation equations

- embedded in the Navier-Stokes equations
 - total enthalpy
 - static enthalpy: follows from the change from Lagrangian to Eulerian frame
 - mechanical energy: follows from calculating work along a stream line
 - internal energy/entropy: total energy mechanical energy
 - irreversibility: positivity of $\boldsymbol{\tau}: \nabla \boldsymbol{v}$
- some are not independent equations (e, \mathcal{E}_k , s)
 - automatically satisfied in real life
 - not necessarily satisfied for a numerical solution



Thermodynamic conservation equations

- embedded in the Navier-Stokes equations
 - total enthalpy
 - static enthalpy: follows from the change from Lagrangian to Eulerian frame
 - mechanical energy: follows from calculating work along a stream line
 - internal energy/entropy: total energy mechanical energy
 - irreversibility: positivity of $\boldsymbol{\tau}: \nabla \boldsymbol{v}$
- some are not independent equations (e, \mathcal{E}_k, s)
 - automatically satisfied in real life
 - not necessarily satisfied for a numerical solution
- $\bullet\,$ formally only hold if no singularities $\rightarrow\,$ some viscosity is required



Thermodynamic conservation equations

- embedded in the Navier-Stokes equations
 - total enthalpy
 - static enthalpy: follows from the change from Lagrangian to Eulerian frame
 - mechanical energy: follows from calculating work along a stream line
 - internal energy/entropy: total energy mechanical energy
 - irreversibility: positivity of $\boldsymbol{\tau}: \nabla \boldsymbol{v}$
- some are not independent equations (e, \mathcal{E}_k , s)
 - automatically satisfied in real life
 - not necessarily satisfied for a numerical solution
- $\bullet\,$ formally only hold if no singularities \rightarrow some viscosity is required

Shocks

- strength determined by conservation of mass, momentum and energy
- entropy generation by viscous stresses is independent of the viscosity
- vanishing viscosity solution: inviscid flow is limit $\mu \rightarrow 0$



Navier-Stokes equations

$$\int_{V} \frac{\partial \rho}{\partial t} \, dV + \oint_{\partial V} \rho \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{n} \, dS = 0$$
$$\int_{V} \frac{\partial \rho \mathbf{v}}{\partial t} \, dV + \oint_{\partial V} \left((\rho \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{n}) \, \mathbf{v} + \rho \mathbf{n} - \boldsymbol{\tau} \cdot \mathbf{n} \right) \, dS = 0$$
$$\int_{V} \frac{\partial \rho \mathbf{E}}{\partial t} \, dV + \oint_{\partial V} \left((\rho \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{n}) \, H - \mathbf{v} \cdot \boldsymbol{\tau} \cdot \mathbf{n} - \mathbf{q} \cdot \mathbf{n} \right) \, dS = 0$$

Generic set of conservation equations

$$\int_{V} \frac{\partial \boldsymbol{u}}{\partial t} \, dV + \oint_{\partial V} \left(\mathbf{f}(\boldsymbol{u}) \cdot \boldsymbol{n} - \mathbf{d}(\boldsymbol{u}, \nabla \boldsymbol{u}) \cdot \boldsymbol{n} \right) \, dS = 0$$

with conservative variables \boldsymbol{u} , convective \boldsymbol{f} and diffusive flux vector \boldsymbol{d}



Navier-Stokes equations

$$\int_{V} \frac{\partial \rho}{\partial t} \, dV + \oint_{\partial V} \rho \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{n} \, dS = 0$$
$$\int_{V} \frac{\partial \rho \mathbf{v}}{\partial t} \, dV + \oint_{\partial V} \left((\rho \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{n}) \, \mathbf{v} + \rho \mathbf{n} - \boldsymbol{\tau} \cdot \mathbf{n} \right) \, dS = 0$$
$$\int_{V} \frac{\partial \rho \mathbf{E}}{\partial t} \, dV + \oint_{\partial V} \left((\rho \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{n}) \, H - \mathbf{v} \cdot \boldsymbol{\tau} \cdot \mathbf{n} - \mathbf{q} \cdot \mathbf{n} \right) \, dS = 0$$

Generic set of conservation equations

$$\frac{\partial \boldsymbol{u}}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot \mathbf{f}(\boldsymbol{u}) - \nabla \cdot \mathbf{d}(\boldsymbol{u}, \nabla \boldsymbol{u}) = 0$$

with conservative variables \boldsymbol{u} , convective \boldsymbol{f} and diffusive flux vector \boldsymbol{d}



Entropy in mathematics Mathematical entropy - theory [Harten1983]

Mathematical entropy ${\mathcal S}$ and entropy flux ${\mathcal F}$

• entropy variables w

$$w_m = \frac{\partial S}{\partial u_m}$$

• existence of (scalar) entropy flux ${\cal F}$

 $\frac{\partial \boldsymbol{\mathcal{F}}}{\partial u_m} = \frac{\partial \boldsymbol{\mathcal{S}}}{\partial u_n} \frac{\partial \mathbf{f}_n}{\partial u_m}$

• convexity of diffusive flux **d**

 $\nabla w_m \cdot \mathbf{d}_m \geq 0$



Entropy in mathematics Mathematical entropy - theory [Harten1983]

Mathematical entropy ${\mathcal S}$ and entropy flux ${\mathcal F}$

• entropy variables w

 $w_m = \frac{\partial S}{\partial u_m}$

• existence of (scalar) entropy flux ${\cal F}$

 $\frac{\partial \boldsymbol{\mathcal{F}}}{\partial u_m} = \frac{\partial \mathcal{S}}{\partial u_n} \frac{\partial \mathbf{f}_n}{\partial u_m}$

• convexity of diffusive flux d

 $\nabla w_m \cdot \mathbf{d}_m \geq 0$

Dual: potential flux ${\cal Q}$ and potential flux ${\cal G}$

• conservative variables u

$$u_m = \frac{\partial \mathcal{Q}}{\partial w_m}$$

• existence of (scalar) potential flux G

 $\frac{\partial \boldsymbol{\mathcal{G}}}{\partial u_m} = \mathbf{f}_m$



Entropy in mathematics Mathematical entropy - theory [Harten1983]

Mathematical entropy ${\mathcal S}$ and entropy flux ${\mathcal F}$

• entropy variables w

 $w_m = \frac{\partial S}{\partial u_m}$

• existence of (scalar) entropy flux ${\cal F}$

 $\frac{\partial \boldsymbol{\mathcal{F}}}{\partial u_m} = \frac{\partial \mathcal{S}}{\partial u_n} \frac{\partial \mathbf{f}_n}{\partial u_m}$

• convexity of diffusive flux d

 $\nabla w_m \cdot \mathbf{d}_m \geq 0$

Navier-Stokes equations : $S = -\rho s$ [Hughes1986]

Dual: potential flux ${\cal Q}$ and potential flux ${\boldsymbol {\cal G}}$

• conservative variables u

$$u_m = \frac{\partial \mathcal{Q}}{\partial w_m}$$

• existence of (scalar) potential flux G

 $\frac{\partial \boldsymbol{\mathcal{G}}}{\partial u_m} = \mathbf{f}_m$



Entropy in mathematics Mathematical entropy - stability

Variational formulation of conservation equations

Conservation formulation \rightarrow bound for entropy [Harten1983, Tadmor2003]

$$\int_{V} \frac{\partial S}{\partial t} \, dV + \oint_{\partial V} \mathcal{F} \cdot \mathbf{n} \, dS = \oint_{\partial V} w_m \mathbf{d}_m \cdot \mathbf{n} \, dS - \int_{V} \nabla w_m \cdot \mathbf{d}_m \, dV$$



Entropy in CFD algorithms

Entropy in mathematics Take-away messages

Existence of mathematical entropy : stability of physical systems

- all conservation equations can be collapsed onto a single one
- this equation describes the convection of entropy and it's destruction
- the entropy serves as a bounded energy, proving stability of the system of equations

Numerical approximations

- entropy equation is derived from conservation equations and therefore not necessarily satisfied
- embedding a discrete equivalent of the entropy equation can bound numerical solution



Shock position, strength and speed

- discrete exact conservation mass, momentum, energy
- generation of small yet positive amount of entropy



Shock position, strength and speed

- discrete exact conservation mass, momentum, energy
- generation of small yet positive amount of entropy

- numerical methods represent solutions by polynomials
- try to represent first p orders in Taylor expansion
- Gibbs oscillations due to non-convergence Taylor near shock





Shock position, strength and speed

- discrete exact conservation mass, momentum, energy
- generation of small yet positive amount of entropy

- numerical methods represent solutions by polynomials
- try to represent first p orders in Taylor expansion
- Gibbs oscillations due to non-convergence Taylor near shock





Shock position, strength and speed

- discrete exact conservation mass, momentum, energy
- generation of small yet positive amount of entropy

- numerical methods represent solutions by polynomials
- try to represent first p orders in Taylor expansion
- Gibbs oscillations due to non-convergence Taylor near shock





Shock position, strength and speed

- discrete exact conservation mass, momentum, energy
- generation of small yet positive amount of entropy

- numerical methods represent solutions by polynomials
- try to represent first p orders in Taylor expansion
- Gibbs oscillations due to non-convergence Taylor near shock




Numerical methods Transonic CFD

Shock position, strength and speed

- discrete exact conservation mass, momentum, energy
- generation of small yet positive amount of entropy

Shock capturing / representation

- numerical methods represent solutions by polynomials
- try to represent first p orders in Taylor expansion
- Gibbs oscillations due to non-convergence Taylor near shock
- artificial viscosity: thicken shock, strength still OK !







Numerical methods Transonic CFD

Shock position, strength and speed

- discrete exact conservation mass, momentum, energy
- generation of small yet positive amount of entropy

Shock capturing / representation

- numerical methods represent solutions by polynomials
- try to represent first p orders in Taylor expansion
- Gibbs oscillations due to non-convergence Taylor near shock
- artificial viscosity: thicken shock, strength still OK !

Non-linear stability required near shocks

- mimick physics: collapse all discrete equations onto entropy equation
- entropy generation mechanism ?
- discrete entropy variables

 $\mu
ightarrow 0$



 $\mu > 0$

Vanishing diffusion conservation equation

$$\int_{V} \frac{\partial u_{m}}{\partial t} dV + \oint_{\partial V} \mathbf{f}_{m} \cdot \mathbf{n} dS = 0$$

Solving for average \boldsymbol{u}^i on control volume V_i

$$V_i \frac{\mathrm{d}\boldsymbol{u}_m^i}{\mathrm{dt}} = -\sum_j \mathcal{H}_m\left(\boldsymbol{u}^i, \boldsymbol{u}^j; \boldsymbol{n}^{ij}\right) = 0$$

with the following requirements for the interface flux $\mathcal{H}\left(.,.;.\right)$

- conservativity $\mathcal{H}(\boldsymbol{u}^{j}, \boldsymbol{u}^{i}; -\boldsymbol{n}^{ij}) = -\mathcal{H}(\boldsymbol{u}^{i}, \boldsymbol{u}^{j}; \boldsymbol{n}^{ij})$
- consistency $\mathcal{H}_m(\boldsymbol{u}, \boldsymbol{u}; \boldsymbol{n}) = \mathbf{f}_m \cdot \boldsymbol{n}$
- stability ?





Evolution of entropy in each cell V_i

$$V_i \, rac{\mathrm{d} \boldsymbol{u}_m^i}{\mathrm{dt}} = -\sum_j \mathcal{H}_m\left(\boldsymbol{u}^i, \boldsymbol{u}^j; \boldsymbol{n}^{ij}
ight)$$





Evolution of entropy in each cell V_i

$$V_{i} \boldsymbol{w}_{m}^{i} \frac{\mathrm{d}\boldsymbol{u}_{m}^{i}}{\mathrm{dt}} = -\sum_{j} \boldsymbol{w}_{m}^{j} \mathcal{H}_{m} \left(\boldsymbol{u}^{i}, \boldsymbol{u}^{j}; \boldsymbol{n}^{ij}\right) - \boldsymbol{\mathcal{G}}(\boldsymbol{u}^{i}) \cdot \sum_{j} \boldsymbol{n}^{ij}$$





Evolution of entropy in each cell V_i

$$V_{i} \boldsymbol{w}_{m}^{i} \frac{\mathrm{d}\boldsymbol{u}_{m}^{i}}{\mathrm{dt}} = -\sum_{j} \boldsymbol{w}_{m}^{i} \mathcal{H}_{m}\left(\boldsymbol{u}^{i}, \boldsymbol{u}^{j}; \boldsymbol{n}^{ij}\right) - \boldsymbol{\mathcal{G}}(\boldsymbol{u}^{i}) \cdot \sum_{j} \boldsymbol{n}^{ij}$$

Evolution of entropy over the whole domain $\boldsymbol{\Omega}$

$$\sum_{i} V_{i} \frac{\mathrm{d}S^{i}}{\mathrm{dt}} = -\sum_{i,j} \left(w_{m}^{i} - w_{m}^{j} \right) \mathcal{H}_{m} \left(\boldsymbol{u}^{i}, \boldsymbol{u}^{j}; \boldsymbol{n}^{ij} \right) - \left(\boldsymbol{\mathcal{G}}(\boldsymbol{u}^{i}) - \boldsymbol{\mathcal{G}}(\boldsymbol{u}^{j}) \right) \cdot \boldsymbol{n}^{ij}$$





Evolution of entropy in each cell V_i

$$V_{i} \boldsymbol{w}_{m}^{i} \frac{\mathrm{d}\boldsymbol{u}_{m}^{i}}{\mathrm{dt}} = -\sum_{j} \boldsymbol{w}_{m}^{i} \mathcal{H}_{m}\left(\boldsymbol{u}^{i}, \boldsymbol{u}^{j}; \boldsymbol{n}^{ij}\right) - \boldsymbol{\mathcal{G}}(\boldsymbol{u}^{i}) \cdot \sum_{j} \boldsymbol{n}^{ij}$$

Evolution of entropy over the whole domain $\boldsymbol{\Omega}$

$$\begin{split} \sum_{i} V_{i} \frac{\mathrm{d}\mathcal{S}^{i}}{\mathrm{dt}} &= -\sum_{i,j} \left(w_{m}^{i} - w_{m}^{j} \right) \mathcal{H}_{m} \left(\boldsymbol{u}^{i}, \boldsymbol{u}^{j}; \boldsymbol{n}^{ij} \right) - \left(\mathcal{G}(\boldsymbol{u}^{i}) - \mathcal{G}(\boldsymbol{u}^{j}) \right) \cdot \boldsymbol{n}^{ij} \\ &= -\sum_{i,j} \left(w_{m}^{i} - w_{m}^{j} \right) \left(\mathcal{H}_{m} \left(\boldsymbol{u}^{i}, \boldsymbol{u}^{j}; \boldsymbol{n}^{ij} \right) - \frac{\partial \mathcal{G}}{\partial w_{m}} (\boldsymbol{\tilde{u}}) \cdot \boldsymbol{n}^{ij} \right) \ , \ \exists \boldsymbol{\tilde{u}} \in [\boldsymbol{u}^{i}, \boldsymbol{u}^{j}] \end{split}$$





Evolution of entropy in each cell V_i

$$V_{i} w_{m}^{i} \frac{\mathrm{d} u_{m}^{i}}{\mathrm{dt}} = -\sum_{j} w_{m}^{i} \mathcal{H}_{m} \left(\boldsymbol{u}^{i}, \boldsymbol{u}^{j}; \boldsymbol{n}^{ij} \right) - \boldsymbol{\mathcal{G}}(\boldsymbol{u}^{i}) \cdot \sum_{j} \boldsymbol{n}^{ij}$$

Evolution of entropy over the whole domain $\boldsymbol{\Omega}$

$$\begin{split} \sum_{i} V_{i} \frac{\mathrm{d}\mathcal{S}^{i}}{\mathrm{dt}} &= -\sum_{i,j} \left(w_{m}^{i} - w_{m}^{j} \right) \mathcal{H}_{m} \left(u^{i}, u^{j}; n^{ij} \right) - \left(\mathcal{G}(u^{i}) - \mathcal{G}(u^{j}) \right) \cdot n^{ij} \\ &= -\sum_{i,j} \left(w_{m}^{i} - w_{m}^{j} \right) \left(\mathcal{H}_{m} \left(u^{i}, u^{j}; n^{ij} \right) - \frac{\partial \mathcal{G}}{\partial w_{m}} (\tilde{u}) \cdot n^{ij} \right) , \ \exists \tilde{u} \in [u^{i}, u^{i}] \\ &= -\sum_{i,j} \underbrace{ \left(w_{m}^{i} - w_{m}^{j} \right) \left(\mathcal{H}_{m} \left(u^{i}, u^{j}; n^{ij} \right) - \mathbf{f}_{m} (\tilde{u}) \cdot n^{ij} \right) }_{>0?} , \ \exists \tilde{u} \in [u^{i}, u^{i}] \end{split}$$





FEM interpolation of working variables \boldsymbol{q}

$$\boldsymbol{q} \in \mathcal{V}^{N}: (\boldsymbol{q}_{m})_{e} = \sum_{i} \boldsymbol{q}_{im} \phi_{i}^{e}$$

 ϕ_i^e shape functions for element e







FEM interpolation of working variables \boldsymbol{q}

$$oldsymbol{q} \in \mathcal{V}^{N}: (oldsymbol{q}_{m})_{e} = \sum_{i} oldsymbol{q}_{im} \phi^{e}_{i}$$

 ϕ_i^e shape functions for element e







Entropy in CFD algorithms

$$\int_{\Omega} v_m \left(\frac{\partial u_m}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot \mathbf{f}_m \right) dV = 0 , \ \forall v_m \in \mathcal{V}$$





$$\sum_{e} \int_{e} \left(v_m \frac{\partial u_m}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot \mathbf{f}_m \right) dV = 0 \ , \ \forall v_m \in \mathcal{V}$$





$$\begin{split} &\sum_{e} \int_{e} \left(\mathbf{v}_{m} \frac{\partial u_{m}}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot \mathbf{f}_{m} \right) dV = 0 \ , \ \forall \mathbf{v}_{m} \in \mathcal{V} \\ &\sum_{e} \left(\int_{e} \left(\mathbf{v}_{m} \frac{\partial \mathbf{u}}{\partial t} + \nabla \mathbf{v}_{m} \cdot \mathbf{f}_{m} \right) dV + \sum_{f \in e} \int_{f} \mathbf{v} \mathbf{f}_{m} \cdot \mathbf{n} dS \right) = 0 \end{split}$$





$$\sum_{e} \int_{e} \left(v_{m} \frac{\partial u_{m}}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot \mathbf{f}_{m} \right) dV = 0 , \forall v_{m} \in \mathcal{V}$$

$$\sum_{e} \left(\int_{e} \left(v_{m} \frac{\partial u}{\partial t} + \nabla v_{m} \cdot \mathbf{f}_{m} \right) dV + \sum_{f \in e} \int_{f} v \mathbf{f}_{m} \cdot \mathbf{n} dS \right) = 0$$

$$\sum_{e} \int_{e} v_{m} \frac{\partial u_{m}}{\partial t} dV + \sum_{e} \int_{e} \nabla v_{m} \cdot \mathbf{f}_{m} dV + \sum_{f} \int_{f} \left(v_{m}^{+} \mathbf{f}_{m}(\mathbf{q}^{+}) - v_{m}^{-} \mathbf{f}_{m}(\mathbf{q}^{-}) \right) \cdot \mathbf{n} dS = 0$$





Galerkin variational formulation

$$\sum_{e} \int_{e} \left(v_{m} \frac{\partial u_{m}}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot \mathbf{f}_{m} \right) dV = 0 , \forall v_{m} \in \mathcal{V}$$

$$\sum_{e} \left(\int_{e} \left(v_{m} \frac{\partial u}{\partial t} + \nabla v_{m} \cdot \mathbf{f}_{m} \right) dV + \sum_{f \in e} \int_{f} v \mathbf{f}_{m} \cdot \mathbf{n} dS \right) = 0$$

$$\sum_{e} \int_{e} v_{m} \frac{\partial u_{m}}{\partial t} dV + \sum_{e} \int_{e} \nabla v_{m} \cdot \mathbf{f}_{m} dV + \sum_{f} \int_{f} \left(v_{m}^{+} \mathbf{f}_{m}(\mathbf{q}^{+}) - v_{m}^{-} \mathbf{f}_{m}(\mathbf{q}^{-}) \right) \cdot \mathbf{n} dS = 0$$



Interface flux $\sim {\rm FVM}$

$$\sum_{e} \int_{e} v \frac{\partial \boldsymbol{u}}{\partial t} dV + \sum_{e} \int_{e} \nabla v_{m} \cdot \mathbf{f}_{m} dV + \sum_{f} \int_{f} \left(v^{+} - v^{-} \right) \mathcal{H} \left(\boldsymbol{q}^{+}, \boldsymbol{q}^{-}; \boldsymbol{n} \right) dS = 0$$



$$\sum_{e} \int_{e} w_{m} \frac{\partial u_{m}}{\partial t} dV + \int_{e} \nabla w_{m} \cdot \mathbf{f} dV + \sum_{f} \int_{f} \left(w_{m}^{+} - w_{m}^{-} \right) \mathcal{H} \left(\mathbf{q}^{+}, \mathbf{q}^{-}; \mathbf{n} \right) dS = 0$$





$$\sum_{e} \int_{e} w_{m} \frac{\partial u_{m}}{\partial t} dV + \int_{e} \nabla w_{m} \cdot \mathbf{f} dV + \sum_{f} \int_{f} \left(w_{m}^{+} - w_{m}^{-} \right) \mathcal{H} \left(\mathbf{q}^{+}, \mathbf{q}^{-}; \mathbf{n} \right) dS = 0$$
$$\sum_{e} \int_{e} \frac{\partial S}{\partial t} dV + \sum_{e} \int_{e} \nabla w_{m} \cdot \frac{\partial \mathcal{G}}{\partial w_{m}} dV + \sum_{f} \int_{f} \left(w_{m}^{+} - w_{m}^{-} \right) \mathcal{H} \left(\mathbf{q}^{+}, \mathbf{q}^{-}; \mathbf{n} \right) dS = 0$$





$$\sum_{e} \int_{e} w_{m} \frac{\partial u_{m}}{\partial t} dV + \int_{e} \nabla w_{m} \cdot \mathbf{f} dV + \sum_{f} \int_{f} (w_{m}^{+} - w_{m}^{-}) \mathcal{H} (\mathbf{q}^{+}, \mathbf{q}^{-}; \mathbf{n}) dS = 0$$

$$\sum_{e} \int_{e} \frac{\partial S}{\partial t} dV + \sum_{e} \int_{e} \nabla w_{m} \cdot \frac{\partial \mathcal{G}}{\partial w_{m}} dV + \sum_{f} \int_{f} (w_{m}^{+} - w_{m}^{-}) \mathcal{H} (\mathbf{q}^{+}, \mathbf{q}^{-}; \mathbf{n}) dS = 0$$

$$\sum_{e} \int_{e} \frac{\partial S}{\partial t} dV + \sum_{e} \int_{e} \nabla \cdot \mathcal{G} dV + \sum_{f} \int_{f} (w_{m}^{+} - w_{m}^{-}) \mathcal{H} (\mathbf{q}^{+}, \mathbf{q}^{-}; \mathbf{n}) dS = 0$$





$$\sum_{e} \int_{e} w_{m} \frac{\partial u_{m}}{\partial t} dV + \int_{e} \nabla w_{m} \cdot \mathbf{f} dV + \sum_{f} \int_{f} (w_{m}^{+} - w_{m}^{-}) \mathcal{H} (\mathbf{q}^{+}, \mathbf{q}^{-}; \mathbf{n}) dS = 0$$

$$\sum_{e} \int_{e} \frac{\partial S}{\partial t} dV + \sum_{e} \int_{e} \nabla w_{m} \cdot \frac{\partial \mathcal{G}}{\partial w_{m}} dV + \sum_{f} \int_{f} (w_{m}^{+} - w_{m}^{-}) \mathcal{H} (\mathbf{q}^{+}, \mathbf{q}^{-}; \mathbf{n}) dS = 0$$

$$\sum_{e} \int_{e} \frac{\partial S}{\partial t} dV + \sum_{e} \int_{e} \nabla \cdot \mathcal{G} dV + \sum_{f} \int_{f} (w_{m}^{+} - w_{m}^{-}) \mathcal{H} (\mathbf{q}^{+}, \mathbf{q}^{-}; \mathbf{n}) dS = 0$$

$$\sum_{e} \int_{e} \frac{\partial S}{\partial t} dV + \sum_{f} \int_{f} ((w_{m}^{+} - w_{m}^{-}) \mathcal{H} (\mathbf{q}^{+}, \mathbf{q}^{-}; \mathbf{n}) dS = 0$$

$$\sum_{e} \int_{e} \frac{\partial S}{\partial t} dV + \sum_{f} \int_{f} ((w_{m}^{+} - w_{m}^{-}) \mathcal{H} (\mathbf{q}^{+}, \mathbf{q}^{-}; \mathbf{n}) - (\mathcal{G}^{+} - \mathcal{G}^{-}) \cdot \mathbf{n}) dS = 0$$





$$\sum_{e} \int_{e} w_{m} \frac{\partial u_{m}}{\partial t} dV + \int_{e} \nabla w_{m} \cdot \mathbf{f} dV + \sum_{f} \int_{f} (w_{m}^{+} - w_{m}^{-}) \mathcal{H} (\mathbf{q}^{+}, \mathbf{q}^{-}; \mathbf{n}) dS = 0$$

$$\sum_{e} \int_{e} \frac{\partial S}{\partial t} dV + \sum_{e} \int_{e} \nabla w_{m} \cdot \frac{\partial \mathcal{G}}{\partial w_{m}} dV + \sum_{f} \int_{f} (w_{m}^{+} - w_{m}^{-}) \mathcal{H} (\mathbf{q}^{+}, \mathbf{q}^{-}; \mathbf{n}) dS = 0$$

$$\sum_{e} \int_{e} \frac{\partial S}{\partial t} dV + \sum_{e} \int_{e} \nabla \cdot \mathcal{G} dV + \sum_{f} \int_{f} (w_{m}^{+} - w_{m}^{-}) \mathcal{H} (\mathbf{q}^{+}, \mathbf{q}^{-}; \mathbf{n}) dS = 0$$

$$\sum_{e} \int_{e} \frac{\partial S}{\partial t} dV + \sum_{f} \int_{f} ((w_{m}^{+} - w_{m}^{-}) \mathcal{H}_{m} (\mathbf{q}^{+}, \mathbf{q}^{-}; \mathbf{n}) - (\mathcal{G}^{+} - \mathcal{G}^{-}) \cdot \mathbf{n}) dS = 0$$

$$\sum_{e} \int_{e} \frac{\partial S}{\partial t} dV = -\sum_{f} \int_{f} (w_{m}^{+} - w_{m}^{-}) \left(\mathcal{H}_{m} (\mathbf{q}^{+}, \mathbf{q}^{-}; \mathbf{n}) - \frac{\partial \mathcal{G}}{\partial w_{m}} (\mathbf{\tilde{w}})\right) dS , \exists \mathbf{\tilde{w}} \in [\mathbf{w}^{+}, \mathbf{w}^{-}]$$





$$\sum_{e} \int_{e} w_{m} \frac{\partial u_{m}}{\partial t} dV + \int_{e} \nabla w_{m} \cdot \mathbf{f} dV + \sum_{f} \int_{f} (w_{m}^{+} - w_{m}^{-}) \mathcal{H}(\mathbf{q}^{+}, \mathbf{q}^{-}; \mathbf{n}) dS = 0$$

$$\sum_{e} \int_{e} \frac{\partial S}{\partial t} dV + \sum_{e} \int_{e} \nabla w_{m} \cdot \frac{\partial \mathcal{G}}{\partial w_{m}} dV + \sum_{f} \int_{f} (w_{m}^{+} - w_{m}^{-}) \mathcal{H}(\mathbf{q}^{+}, \mathbf{q}^{-}; \mathbf{n}) dS = 0$$

$$\sum_{e} \int_{e} \frac{\partial S}{\partial t} dV + \sum_{e} \int_{e} \nabla \cdot \mathcal{G} dV + \sum_{f} \int_{f} (w_{m}^{+} - w_{m}^{-}) \mathcal{H}(\mathbf{q}^{+}, \mathbf{q}^{-}; \mathbf{n}) dS = 0$$

$$\sum_{e} \int_{e} \frac{\partial S}{\partial t} dV + \sum_{f} \int_{f} ((w_{m}^{+} - w_{m}^{-}) \mathcal{H}_{m}(\mathbf{q}^{+}, \mathbf{q}^{-}; \mathbf{n}) - (\mathcal{G}^{+} - \mathcal{G}^{-}) \cdot \mathbf{n}) dS = 0$$

$$\sum_{e} \int_{e} \frac{\partial S}{\partial t} dV = -\sum_{f} \int_{f} (w_{m}^{+} - w_{m}^{-}) \left(\mathcal{H}_{m}(\mathbf{q}^{+}, \mathbf{q}^{-}; \mathbf{n}) - \frac{\partial \mathcal{G}}{\partial w_{m}}(\tilde{\mathbf{w}})\right) dS, \quad \exists \tilde{\mathbf{w}} \in [\mathbf{w}^{+}, \mathbf{w}^{-}]$$

$$\sum_{e} \int_{e} \frac{\partial S}{\partial t} dV = -\sum_{f} \int_{f} (w_{m}^{+} - w_{m}^{-}) \left(\mathcal{H}_{m}(\mathbf{q}^{+}, \mathbf{q}^{-}; \mathbf{n}) - \mathbf{f}(\tilde{\mathbf{w}})\right) dS$$



- discontinuity \rightarrow interface fluxes $\mathcal{H}(q^+, q^-; n)$
 - conservativity: $\mathcal{H}(\boldsymbol{q}^+, \boldsymbol{q}^-; \boldsymbol{n}) = -\mathcal{H}(\boldsymbol{q}^-, \boldsymbol{q}^+; -\boldsymbol{n})$
 - consistency: $\mathcal{H}(\boldsymbol{q}, \boldsymbol{q}; \boldsymbol{n}) = \mathbf{f}(\boldsymbol{q}) \cdot \boldsymbol{n}$
 - stability ?



- discontinuity \rightarrow interface fluxes $\mathcal{H}(q^+, q^-; n)$
 - conservativity: $\mathcal{H}(\boldsymbol{q}^+, \boldsymbol{q}^-; \boldsymbol{n}) = -\mathcal{H}(\boldsymbol{q}^-, \boldsymbol{q}^+; -\boldsymbol{n})$
 - consistency: $\mathcal{H}(\boldsymbol{q}, \boldsymbol{q}; \boldsymbol{n}) = \mathbf{f}(\boldsymbol{q}) \cdot \boldsymbol{n}$
 - stability ?
- rigourous non-linear stability: Entropy Consistent Fluxes "E-flux" [Oleinik]

 $\left(w_{m}^{+}-w_{m}^{-}\right)\ \left(\mathcal{H}_{m}\left(\boldsymbol{q}^{+},\boldsymbol{q}^{-};\boldsymbol{n}\right)-f_{m}\left(\boldsymbol{\tilde{q}}\right)\cdot\boldsymbol{n}\right)\geq0\ ,\ \forall\boldsymbol{\tilde{q}}\in\left[\boldsymbol{q}^{+},\boldsymbol{q}^{-}\right]$



- discontinuity \rightarrow interface fluxes $\mathcal{H}(\boldsymbol{q}^+, \boldsymbol{q}^-; \boldsymbol{n})$
 - conservativity: $\mathcal{H}(\boldsymbol{q}^+, \boldsymbol{q}^-; \boldsymbol{n}) = -\mathcal{H}(\boldsymbol{q}^-, \boldsymbol{q}^+; -\boldsymbol{n})$
 - consistency: $\mathcal{H}(\boldsymbol{q}, \boldsymbol{q}; \boldsymbol{n}) = \mathbf{f}(\boldsymbol{q}) \cdot \boldsymbol{n}$
 - stability ?
- rigourous non-linear stability: Entropy Consistent Fluxes "E-flux" [Oleinik]

 $\left(w_{m}^{+}-w_{m}^{-}\right)\ \left(\mathcal{H}_{m}\left(\boldsymbol{q}^{+},\boldsymbol{q}^{-};\boldsymbol{n}\right)-f_{m}\left(\tilde{\boldsymbol{q}}\right)\cdot\boldsymbol{n}\right)\geq0\ ,\ \forall\tilde{\boldsymbol{q}}\in\left[\boldsymbol{q}^{+},\boldsymbol{q}^{-}\right]$

• Approximate Riemann Solvers usually are E-fluxes





- discontinuity \rightarrow interface fluxes $\mathcal{H}(\boldsymbol{q}^+, \boldsymbol{q}^-; \boldsymbol{n})$
 - conservativity: $\mathcal{H}(\boldsymbol{q}^+, \boldsymbol{q}^-; \boldsymbol{n}) = -\mathcal{H}(\boldsymbol{q}^-, \boldsymbol{q}^+; -\boldsymbol{n})$
 - consistency: $\mathcal{H}(\boldsymbol{q}, \boldsymbol{q}; \boldsymbol{n}) = \mathbf{f}(\boldsymbol{q}) \cdot \boldsymbol{n}$
 - stability ?
- rigourous non-linear stability: Entropy Consistent Fluxes "E-flux" [Oleinik]

 $\left(w_m^+ - w_m^-\right) \ \left(\mathcal{H}_m\left(\boldsymbol{q}^+, \boldsymbol{q}^-; \boldsymbol{n}\right) - f_m\left(\tilde{\boldsymbol{q}}\right) \cdot \boldsymbol{n}\right) \geq 0 \ , \ \forall \tilde{\boldsymbol{q}} \in [\boldsymbol{q}^+, \boldsymbol{q}^-]$

- Approximate Riemann Solvers usually are E-fluxes
- $\bullet~$ E-fluxes positive dissipation \rightarrow correct shock representation





- discontinuity \rightarrow interface fluxes $\mathcal{H}(\boldsymbol{q}^+, \boldsymbol{q}^-; \boldsymbol{n})$
 - conservativity: $\mathcal{H}(\boldsymbol{q}^+, \boldsymbol{q}^-; \boldsymbol{n}) = -\mathcal{H}(\boldsymbol{q}^-, \boldsymbol{q}^+; -\boldsymbol{n})$
 - consistency: $\mathcal{H}(\boldsymbol{q}, \boldsymbol{q}; \boldsymbol{n}) = \mathbf{f}(\boldsymbol{q}) \cdot \boldsymbol{n}$
 - stability ?
- rigourous non-linear stability: Entropy Consistent Fluxes "E-flux" [Oleinik]

 $\left(w_m^+ - w_m^-\right) \ \left(\mathcal{H}_m\left(\boldsymbol{q}^+, \boldsymbol{q}^-; \boldsymbol{n}\right) - f_m\left(\tilde{\boldsymbol{q}}\right) \cdot \boldsymbol{n}\right) \geq 0 \ , \ \forall \tilde{\boldsymbol{q}} \in [\boldsymbol{q}^+, \boldsymbol{q}^-]$

- Approximate Riemann Solvers usually are E-fluxes
- $\bullet~$ E-fluxes positive dissipation \rightarrow correct shock representation
- Entropy consistent FVM
 - use of E-fluxes
 - maximum criteria on high order reconstruction





- discontinuity \rightarrow interface fluxes $\mathcal{H}(\boldsymbol{q}^+, \boldsymbol{q}^-; \boldsymbol{n})$
 - conservativity: $\mathcal{H}(\boldsymbol{q}^+, \boldsymbol{q}^-; \boldsymbol{n}) = -\mathcal{H}(\boldsymbol{q}^-, \boldsymbol{q}^+; -\boldsymbol{n})$
 - consistency: $\mathcal{H}(\boldsymbol{q}, \boldsymbol{q}; \boldsymbol{n}) = \mathbf{f}(\boldsymbol{q}) \cdot \boldsymbol{n}$
 - stability ?
- rigourous non-linear stability: Entropy Consistent Fluxes "E-flux" [Oleinik]

 $\left(w_m^+ - w_m^-\right) \ \left(\mathcal{H}_m\left(\boldsymbol{q}^+, \boldsymbol{q}^-; \boldsymbol{n}\right) - f_m\left(\tilde{\boldsymbol{q}}\right) \cdot \boldsymbol{n}\right) \geq 0 \ , \ \forall \tilde{\boldsymbol{q}} \in [\boldsymbol{q}^+, \boldsymbol{q}^-]$

- Approximate Riemann Solvers usually are E-fluxes
- $\bullet~$ E-fluxes positive dissipation \rightarrow correct shock representation
- Entropy consistent FVM
 - use of E-fluxes
 - maximum criteria on high order reconstruction
- Entropy stable DG (ESDG)
 - use w as working variables $\in \mathcal{V}$ instead of conservative u
 - use of E-fluxes
 - integration by parts should be discretely mimicked summation by parts
 - quadrature error since update in conservative variables !





DG shock capturing for DNS and LES Methods

Challenges

- robustness with respect to shocks through energy stability
- minimal impact on turbulent flow features



Artificial viscosity



Entropy stable DG



Entropy in CFD algorithms

Kelvin-Helmholtz instability - impact of shock capturing strategies

DG shock capturing for DNS and LES Methods

Study submitted to Journal of Computational Physics [Bilocq24*]

- DG: vanilla DG without shock capturing (DG)
 - most accurate (no quadrature error)
 - no stabilisation
- DG-AV: DG + sensor based artificial viscosity [Person06][Henneman21]
 - additional viscosity at shocks \rightarrow dissipates turbulence
 - sensors to detect underresolution
- ESDG: Entropy stable DG [Gassner16][Chan]
 - formulation in w error in update
 - full quadrature
 - expensive
- ESDGSEM: Spectral Element Entropy Stable DG [Gassner16][Chan19]
 - formulation in w
 - summation by parts by reduced tensor-product quadrature
- DG-SBP: summation by parts DG
 - DG operator expressed in conserved variables
 - summation by parts operator
- DG-ES: sensor based switch between DG and ESDG



DG shock capturing for DNS and LES Compressible homogeneous isotropic turbulence - test case

Compressible homogeneous isotropic turbulence

- $M_t = 0.6, Re_{\lambda} = 100$
- starting from incompressible flow field
- high vorticity $\rightarrow \epsilon_s$
- acoustic transient $\rightarrow epsilon_d$ and \mathcal{D}_p
- shocklets form $M \approx 2 \rightarrow \epsilon_d$ and \mathcal{D}_p
- N cells per direction, order p=5, equivalent resolution n = (p+1)N = 66





Compressible homogeneous isotropic turbulence - convergence criterion

Kinetic energy budget on generic control volume

$$\int_{V} \frac{\partial \mathcal{E}_{k}}{\partial t} \, dV + \oint_{\partial V} \left(\rho \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{n} \right) \mathcal{E}_{k} \, dS = \oint_{\partial V} -\mathbf{v} \cdot p \mathbf{n} \, dS + \oint_{\partial V} \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{\tau} \cdot \mathbf{n} \, dS + \int_{V} p \nabla \cdot \mathbf{v} \, dV - \int_{V} \mathbf{\tau} : \nabla \mathbf{v} \, dV$$



Compressible homogeneous isotropic turbulence - convergence criterion

Kinetic energy budget on fully periodic domain

$$\int_{V} \frac{\partial \mathcal{E}_{k}}{\partial t} \, dV + \oint_{\partial V} (\rho \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{n}) \, \mathcal{E}_{k} \, dS = \oint_{\partial V} - \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{p} \mathbf{n} \, dS + \oint_{\partial V} \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{r} \cdot \mathbf{n} \, dS + \int_{V} p \nabla \cdot \mathbf{v} \, dV - \int_{V} \mathbf{\tau} : \nabla \mathbf{v} \, dV$$



Compressible homogeneous isotropic turbulence - convergence criterion

Kinetic energy budget on

$$\int_{V} \frac{\partial \mathcal{E}_{k}}{\partial t} \, dV + \oint_{\partial V} (\rho \mathbf{v} - \mathbf{n}) \mathcal{E}_{k} \, dS = \oint_{\partial V} -\mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{p} \mathbf{n} \, dS + \oint_{\partial V} \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{r} \cdot \mathbf{n} \, dS + \int_{V} p \nabla \cdot \mathbf{v} \, dV - \int_{V} \mathbf{\tau} : \nabla \mathbf{v} \, dV$$

Newtonian fluid $\boldsymbol{\tau} = \mu \left(\nabla \boldsymbol{v} + \nabla \boldsymbol{v}^{T} - \frac{2}{3} \nabla \cdot \boldsymbol{v} I \right)$ Split in solenoidal (vorticity) and dilatational dissipation

$$\int_{V} \boldsymbol{\tau} : \nabla \boldsymbol{v} dV = \underbrace{2 \int_{V} \mu \frac{\boldsymbol{\omega} \cdot \boldsymbol{\omega}}{2} dV}_{\epsilon_{s}} + \underbrace{\frac{4}{3} \int_{V} \mu \left(\nabla \cdot \boldsymbol{v}\right)^{2} dV}_{\epsilon_{d}}$$



Compressible homogeneous isotropic turbulence - convergence criterion

Kinetic energy budget on

$$\int_{V} \frac{\partial \mathcal{E}_{k}}{\partial t} \, dV + \oint_{\partial V} (\rho \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{n}) \, \mathcal{E}_{k} \, dS = \oint_{\partial V} - \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{p} \mathbf{n} \, dS + \oint_{\partial V} \mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{r} \cdot \mathbf{n} \, dS + \int_{V} p \nabla \cdot \mathbf{v} \, dV - \int_{V} \mathbf{\tau} : \nabla \mathbf{v} \, dV$$

Newtonian fluid $\boldsymbol{\tau} = \mu \left(\nabla \boldsymbol{v} + \nabla \boldsymbol{v}^{T} - \frac{2}{3} \nabla \cdot \boldsymbol{v} \boldsymbol{l} \right)$ Split in solenoidal (vorticity) and dilatational dissipation

$$\int_{V} \boldsymbol{\tau} : \nabla \boldsymbol{v} dV = \underbrace{2 \int_{V} \mu \frac{\boldsymbol{\omega} \cdot \boldsymbol{\omega}}{2} dV}_{\epsilon_{s}} + \underbrace{\frac{4}{3} \int_{V} \mu \left(\nabla \cdot \boldsymbol{v}\right)^{2} dV}_{\epsilon_{d}}$$

and therefore

$$\underbrace{-\frac{\mathrm{d}\int}{\mathrm{dt}}_{V}\mathcal{E}_{k}dV}_{\epsilon_{k}} = \underbrace{2\int_{V}\mu\frac{\boldsymbol{\omega}\cdot\boldsymbol{\omega}}{2}dV}_{\epsilon_{s}} + \underbrace{\frac{4}{3}\int_{V}\mu\left(\nabla\cdot\boldsymbol{v}\right)^{2}dV}_{\epsilon_{d}} - \underbrace{\int_{V}p\nabla\cdot\boldsymbol{v}\,dV}_{\mathcal{D}_{p}}$$

Kinetic energy budget $\Delta \epsilon = \epsilon_s + \epsilon_d + D_p - \epsilon_k$ is measure for instantaneous error



Entropy in CFD algorithms

DG shock capturing for DNS and LES Compressible homogeneous isotropic turbulence - contributions





DG shock capturing for DNS and LES Compressible homogeneous isotropic turbulence - budgets




DG shock capturing for DNS and LES Compressible homogeneous isotropic turbulence - stability

	p = 3			p = 4			p = 5		
	4 ³	8 ³	16 ³	3 ³	6 ³	13 ³	3 ³	5 ³	11 ³
DG	×	×	\checkmark	×	×	\checkmark	×	×	\checkmark
DG-AV	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark
DG-SBP	X	X	\checkmark	X	×	×	X	X	\checkmark
ESDGSEM	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark
ESDG	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark
DG-ES	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark



DG shock capturing for DNS and LES Compressible homogeneous isotropic turbulence - sensor dependence



Dilatational dissipation ϵ_d



DG shock capturing for DNS and LES Conclusions

Conclusions

- ESDGSEM and ESDGSEM provide robustness, but not fully accurate
- DG-AV worst accuracy, high dependence on sensor
- vanilla DG, using conserved variables, most accurate
- summation by parts operator is not stabilising DG, but not jeopardizing accuracy
- best of both worlds: vanilla DG + ESDG in "troubled cells"
- DG-ES: low dependence on sensor

Future work

- validation on shock-turbulence interaction (shock stabilisation)
- ${lackbdot}$ integration methods in body-fitted solver ArgoDG w/ Cenaero

Targeted applications

- DNS and LES of high-speed turbomachinery
- hypersonic flow during atmospheric reentry

