

University of Liège  
Faculty of Law, Political Science and Criminology  
Department of Political Science – UR Cité  
European Studies Unit (ESU)



Thesis submitted for the degree of  
Doctor of Philosophy in Political and Social Sciences

---

*A Tale of Europe(anness)*  
*Interpretations of the “European State” in the Discourse of  
the Political Institutions of the European Union*

---

**Annie NIESSEN**

---

Jury

Prof. Dr. **Geoffrey GEUENS**, University of Liège (thesis co-director)  
Prof. Dr. **Geoffrey GRANDJEAN**, University of Liège (president)  
Dr. **Gilles GRIN**, Jean Monnet Foundation for Europe, University of Lausanne (member)  
Prof. Dr. **Quentin MICHEL**, University of Liège (thesis director)  
Prof. Dr. **Kiran Klaus PATEL**, Ludwig Maximilian University of Munich (committee member)  
Prof. Dr. **Maria STOICHEVA**, Sofia University “St. Kliment Ohridski” (member)

Defended on July 1st, 2021 in Liège, Belgium

# Table of contents

|  |             |
|--|-------------|
| <i>Acknowledgments</i> .....   | <i>iii</i>  |
| <i>Foreword</i> .....  | <i>xi</i>   |
| <i>List of tables</i> .....  | <i>xv</i>   |
| <i>List of figures</i> .....   | <i>xv</i>   |
| <i>List of abbreviations</i> .....   | <i>xvii</i> |
| <b>INTRODUCTION</b> .....  | <b>3</b>    |
| <b>CHAPTER 1. The “European State” formulation: Genesis and legal considerations</b> ..... | <b>13</b>   |
| <b>1. The membership clause: Article 49 TEU</b> .....                                      | <b>14</b>   |
| 1.1. The primary eligibility conditions.....   | 14          |
| 1.2. The role of the institutions.....   | 18          |
| <b>2. The “European State” formulation</b> .....   | <b>19</b>   |
| 2.1. Constancy of the clause.....  | 20          |
| 2.2. The choice of the “European State” formulation.....                                   | 22          |
| 2.2.1. Pre- and co-existing European treaties.....   | 22          |
| 2.2.2. The “Europe” section in international treaties.....                                 | 25          |
| <b>2. A legal outlook on the “European State”</b> .....                                    | <b>26</b>   |
| <b>3. Wrap-up and concluding remarks</b> .....   | <b>32</b>   |
| <b>CHAPTER 2. Europe, Europeanness, and enlargement: Theoretical considerations</b> .....  | <b>35</b>   |
| <b>1. Europe: A woolly, knitted and layered notion</b> .....                               | <b>36</b>   |
| 1.1. Knitted: Twists and turns of the <i>self</i> and the <i>other</i> .....               | 36          |
| 1.2. Woolly: Between reality and fiction.....  | 38          |
| 1.3. Layered: Piled-up and contradictory meanings.....                                     | 41          |
| <b>2. Self-understanding and identity: Political construction of Europeanness</b> .....    | <b>46</b>   |
| 2.1. European collective identity: Definitional attempts.....                              | 46          |
| 2.1.1. Cultural-“ethnic” repertoire : Myths, heritage, and historical narratives.....      | 48          |
| 2.1.2. Social-political repertoire: Norms and values.....                                  | 50          |
| 2.2. Collective identity or self-understanding?.....                                       | 51          |

|   |   |            |
|---|---|------------|
| 2.3.  | Europeanness as discursive political construction.....                    | 52         |
| <b>3.</b>   | <b>Enlargement: Borders, norms and discourse .....</b>                    | <b>54</b>  |
| 3.1.  | Enlargement and borders.....  | 54         |
| 3.2.  | Enlargement as a discursive normative process .....                       | 56         |
| <b>4.</b>   | <b>Wrap-up and concluding remarks.....</b>                                | <b>60</b>  |
| <b>CHAPTER 3. EU institutional interpretations of Europe(anness): A first overview.....</b> |   | <b>67</b>  |
| <b>1.</b>   | <b>Interpretations previously identified in scholarly literature.....</b> | <b>68</b>  |
| 1.1.  | A European space .....  | 69         |
| 1.2.  | Common cultural features .....  | 70         |
| 1.2.1.  | A cultural heritage.....  | 70         |
| 1.2.2.  | Common culture or common civilization.....                                | 71         |
| 1.3.  | A common history: Historical narratives .....                             | 74         |
| 1.4.  | A common religious background.....  | 76         |
| 1.4.1.  | Christian heritage .....  | 77         |
| 1.4.2.  | Christian values.....   | 79         |
| 1.5.  | Democratic heritage and common values .....                               | 80         |
| 1.5.1.  | Democracy as a common heritage: Greece .....                              | 80         |
| 1.5.2.  | Democracy as a political value: Spain .....                               | 84         |
| 1.5.3.  | Shared values and norms .....   | 86         |
| <b>2.</b>   | <b>Interpretations in the configuration of the EU .....</b>               | <b>88</b>  |
| 2.1.  | Constitutional ties: Colonial legacy and “decentralized Europe”.....      | 88         |
| 2.1.1.  | Integration or association: The importance of constitutional ties.....    | 89         |
| 2.1.2.  | Eurafrica .....   | 92         |
| 2.1.3.  | Overseas Europe: The Outermost Regions.....                               | 94         |
| 2.1.4.  | Other integrated non-European territories.....                            | 98         |
| 2.1.5.  | The integrated territories and the idea of “decentralized Europe”.....    | 98         |
| 2.2.  | A liberal market economy? .....   | 102        |
| <b>3.</b>   | <b>Wrap-up and concluding remarks.....</b>                                | <b>105</b> |
| <b>CHAPTER 4. Institutional discourse: Theoretical and methodological approaches.....</b>   |   | <b>111</b> |
| <b>1.</b>   | <b>Institutional discourse: Theoretical considerations.....</b>           | <b>112</b> |
| 1.1.  | Institutions and discourse .....  | 112        |
| 1.2.  | Institutional discourse and power: Critical Discourse Analysis .....      | 115        |

|   |  |            |
|---|--|------------|
| 1.3.  | Institutional discourse and ideas: Discursive Institutionalism .....           | 116        |
| 1.4.  | Institutional discourse and concepts: The Conceptual-Historical approach ..... | 117        |
| <b>2.</b>   | <b>Methodological approach: Corpus and analysis method .....</b>               | <b>118</b> |
| 2.1.  | Corpus and dataset .....   | 118        |
| 2.1.1.  | Types of documents .....   | 119        |
| 2.1.2.  | Archival research .....  | 120        |
| 2.2.  | Data coding and classification .....   | 123        |
| 2.2.1.  | Thematic Analysis.....   | 124        |
| 2.2.2.  | Themes and sub-themes .....  | 130        |
| 2.3.  | Limitations.....   | 136        |
| <b>4.</b>   | <b>Wrap-up and concluding remarks.....</b>                                     | <b>137</b> |
| <b>CHAPTER 5. Interpretations in the EU institutional discourse: Thematic analysis.....</b> |  | <b>143</b> |
| <b>1.</b>   | <b>Geographical interpretation.....</b>  | <b>144</b> |
| 1.1.  | Discursive geographical references .....                                       | 144        |
| 1.1.1.  | European continent.....  | 145        |
| 1.1.2.  | Geographical Europe.....   | 148        |
| 1.1.3.  | Geographical ties and proximity.....   | 151        |
| 1.2.  | Geographical interpretation through cases .....                                | 152        |
| 1.2.1.  | Western and northern borders: The British Isles and the Nordic countries ...   | 152        |
| 1.2.2.  | Southeastern borders: Turkey and Morocco.....                                  | 156        |
| 1.2.3.  | Eastern borders: Central and Eastern European countries and Russia.....        | 159        |
| <b>2.</b>   | <b>Cultural interpretation.....</b>  | <b>161</b> |
| 2.1.  | Discursive cultural references.....  | 161        |
| 2.1.1.  | Common European culture.....   | 161        |
| 2.1.2.  | Cultural ties.....   | 164        |
| 2.1.3.  | Common European civilization .....   | 164        |
| 2.1.4.  | Common cultural heritage .....   | 170        |
| 2.1.5.  | Cultural traditions.....   | 172        |
| 2.2.  | Cultural references through cases .....  | 174        |
| 2.2.1.  | Cyprus.....  | 174        |
| 2.2.2.  | Greece.....  | 176        |
| <b>3.</b>   | <b>Historical interpretation.....</b>  | <b>178</b> |

|   |   |            |
|---|---|------------|
| 3.1.  | Discursive historical references .....  | 178        |
| 3.1.1.  | Common European history .....   | 179        |
| 3.1.2.  | Common (historical) heritage .....  | 181        |
| 3.1.3.  | Historical ties .....   | 182        |
| 3.2.  | The Central and Eastern European Countries: A historical narrative of reconciliation..... | 184        |
| <b>4.</b>   | <b>Political interpretation.....</b>  | <b>186</b> |
| 4.1.  | Discursive political references.....  | 186        |
| 4.1.1.  | European-like political-legal system.....   | 187        |
| 4.1.2.  | Common political heritage .....   | 188        |
| 4.1.3.  | Common political traditions .....   | 189        |
| 4.1.4.  | Common values.....  | 191        |
| 4.1.5.  | Common ideals .....   | 193        |
| 4.1.6.  | Common humanist tenets .....  | 194        |
| 4.2.  | Political references through cases.....   | 196        |
| 4.2.1.  | Implicitness: Freedom and peace in the EU's founding narrative.....                       | 197        |
| 4.2.2.  | Impulsion: The southern dictatorships .....   | 198        |
| 4.2.3.  | Explicitness: The Copenhagen criteria.....  | 203        |
| 4.2.4.  | Formalization: The Constitution for Europe and the Treaty of Lisbon.....                  | 205        |
| <b>5.</b>   | <b>Interactions between the interpretations .....</b>                                     | <b>208</b> |
| <b>6.</b>   | <b>Wrap-up and concluding remarks.....</b>  | <b>213</b> |
| <b>CHAPTER 6. Interpretations in the EU institutional discourse: Statistical analysis .....</b> |   | <b>221</b> |
| <b>1.</b>   | <b>Corpus distribution.....</b>   | <b>221</b> |
| 1.1.  | General interpretations .....   | 222        |
| 1.2.  | Sub-themes .....  | 223        |
| <b>2.</b>   | <b>Temporal distribution.....</b>   | <b>226</b> |
| 2.1.  | General interpretations .....   | 226        |
| 2.2.  | Sub-themes .....  | 230        |
| <b>3.</b>   | <b>Contextual distribution.....</b>   | <b>233</b> |
| 3.1.  | General interpretations .....   | 234        |
| 3.2.  | Membership and enlargement: eligibility assessment timeline .....                         | 237        |
| 3.3.  | Sub-themes .....  | 241        |

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| <b>4. Institutional distribution .....</b>    | <b>244</b> |
| 4.1. Political institutions.....              | 244        |
| 4.2. Discourse genres .....                   | 247        |
| 4.3. Sub-themes .....                         | 248        |
| <b>5. Wrap-up and concluding remarks.....</b> | <b>249</b> |
| <b><i>DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION.....</i></b>  | <b>255</b> |
| <b><i>Bibliography.....</i></b>               | <b>273</b> |