

Caroline Buts
José Luis Buendía Sierra (eds)

Milestones in State Aid Case Law

EStAL's First 15 Years in Perspective



THE LEGAL PUBLISHER
lexxion
● BERLIN
● BRUSSELS

Table of Contents

Foreword

EStAL and the Sword in the Stone	V
--	---

Chapter 1 · BP Chemicals

<i>BP Chemicals: Lessons to Be Recalled in the Context of Applying the MEIP to Consecutive State Measures in the Financial Sector</i> ^{*2017}	2
<i>Małgorzata Agnieszka Cyndecka</i>	

Chapter 2 · PreussenElektra

<i>PreussenElektra – Dead or Alive?</i> ^{*2017}	16
<i>Kai Struckmann</i>	

Chapter 3 · Sardegna

<i>Every Family Is the Same, Every Family Is Different: State Aid and Free Movement</i> ^{*2017}	34
<i>Andrea Biondi</i>	

Chapter 4 · Stardust Marine

<i>Notion d'Aide d'Etat Remarques sur l'Arrêt Stardust Marine du 16 Mai 2002</i>	46
<i>Alain Alexis</i>	
<i>The Stardust Marine Case (C-482/99)</i> ^{*2017}	56
<i>Juan Jorge Piernas López</i>	

Chapter 5 · SMI

<i>The SMI-Judgment – a New Course for Recovery of Illegal State Aid?</i>	70
<i>Andreas Knaul</i>	
<i>The Principles for Recovery: SMI or the Importance of a Meticulous Assessment of State Interventions by the Granting Authorities and the Commission</i> ^{*2017}	77
<i>Maria J. Segura, Marianne Clayton and Egill Olafsson</i>	

Chapter 6 · Altmark

Bidding Procedures in EC State Aid Surveillance over Public Services after Altmark Trans.	90
<i>Ulrich Schnelle</i>	
Altmark: The Mount Everest of State Aid ^{*2017}	96
<i>Phedon Nicolaides and Guido Paolini</i>	

Chapter 7 · Chronopost

Chronopost II: The Application of the Market Economy Investor Principle in Reserved Sectors.	114
<i>Isabela Atanasiu</i>	
Chronopost I – Re-Annotated ^{*2017}	120
<i>Andreas Bartosch</i>	

Chapter 8 · Pearle

“Pearle: So Much Unsaid!”	128
<i>Edoardo Gambaro, Alessandro Nucara, Luca Prete</i>	
Pearle Revisited – Or Does Our State Aided Vision Really Improve with Hindsight? ^{*2017}	152
<i>Leigh Hancher</i>	

Chapter 9 · BUPA

BUPA v. Commission	160
<i>Andrea Biondi</i>	
Case T-289/03 BUPA: The Illusion of Flexibility That Strengthened Altmark ^{*2017}	170
<i>Alfonso Lamadrid de Pablo</i>	

Chapter 10 · Forum 187

Case Report Joined Cases C-182/03 (Belgium) and C-217/03 (Forum 187) v. Commission	180
<i>Jayant Mehta</i>	
Belgium and Forum 187 v. Commission Revisited: A Sound and Correct Legal Source for an At Arm’s Length Principle? ^{*2017}	197
<i>Tony Joris and Wout De Cock</i>	

Chapter 11 · Azores

Review of the Judgment in Case C-88/03, <i>Portugal v. Commission</i> (Azores Tax Regime)	214
<i>Carsten Zatschler</i>	
Tales from an Outermost Region: How Does the Azores Judgment Look from a Distance?*²⁰¹⁷	223
<i>Fiona Wishlade</i>	

Chapter 12 · Ryanair Charleroi

CFI Judgment in the Charleroi Case T-196/04	234
<i>Dennis Oswell, George Metaxas and Esfandiar Vahida</i>	
The Ryanair Charleroi Judgment: What Is Its Legacy?*²⁰¹⁷	246
<i>Nicole Robins and Hannes Geldof</i>	

Chapter 13 · Laboratoires Boiron

Review of Judgment Laboratoires Boiron, Case C-526/04	264
<i>Holger Wissel and Dominik Becker</i>	
Laboratoires Boiron SA v ACOSS: A Retrospective*²⁰¹⁷	272
<i>Isabel Taylor</i>	

Chapter 14 · Athinaiki I & II

Athinaiki Techniki II	282
<i>Sébastien Thomas</i>	
The Status of Complainants in State Aid Cases: A Look Back into the Athinaiki Techniki Saga*²⁰¹⁷	300
<i>Fernando Pastor-Merchante</i>	

Chapter 15 · CELF I & II

The CELF-Judgment: A Precarious Conception of the Standstill Obligation	314
<i>Thomas Jaeger</i>	
Judgment of the Court of the European Union in Case C-1/09, <i>CELF v SIDE</i>	334
<i>Adrien Giraud</i>	
The Powers and Obligations of National Courts with Regard to Unlawful State Aid: Lessons Learned from <i>CELF I</i> and <i>CELF II</i>*²⁰¹⁷	342
<i>Jacques Derenne</i>	

Chapter 16 · British Aggregates

Selectivity and Taxation – Reflections in the Light of Case C-487/06 P, British Aggregates Association	358
<i>Michael Honoré</i>	
The <i>British Aggregates Saga – Looking Back at an Earlier Stage</i> of the Selectivity Discussion ^{*2017}	377
<i>Clemens Ziegler</i>	

Chapter 17 · Paint Graphos

The Preliminary Ruling of the Court of Justice on Preferential Taxation of Cooperatives and State Aid Rules	386
<i>Flavia Tomat</i>	
Finding Selectivity or the Art of Comparison ^{*2017}	410
<i>José Luis Buendía Sierra</i>	

Chapter 18 · Dutch NOx

NOx Emission Trading Rights: A Government Gift or Value Created by Undertakings?	424
<i>Piet Jan Slot</i>	
The <i>NOx Case – Still Trying to Fit in a System</i> ^{*2017}	438
<i>Philipp Werner</i>	

Chapter 19 · DHL Leipzig Halle

State Aid and Public Funding for Infrastructure ^{*2017}	454
<i>Erika Szyszczak</i>	

Chapter 20 · Smurfit Kappa

Commission Guidelines and their Limits	
T-304/08 <i>Smurfit Kappa</i> ^{*2017}	466
<i>Vincent Verouden</i>	

Chapter 21 · Gibraltar

Gibraltar: Beyond the Pillars of Hercules of Selectivity	480
<i>Pierpaolo Rossi-Maccanico</i>	
Gibraltar: A Landmark Judgment Which Was Not Meant to Be ^{*2017}	489
<i>Pierpaolo Rossi-Maccanico</i>	

Chapter 22 · EDF

Tax Measures and the Private Investor Test: The Court of Justice Endorses a Level Playing Field	508
<i>Niels Baeten and Liliane Gam</i>	
<i>European Commission v Electricité de France – a Distant Mirror</i>^{*2017}	517
<i>Bernhard von Wendland and Hanna Standke</i>	

Chapter 23 · France Télécom

The Bouygues Case: A Never Ending Story	532
<i>María Muñoz de Juan</i>	
Can Mere Declarations by a State Be Considered as an Advantage Drawn from State Resources: An Economic Perspective ^{*2017}	552
<i>Alejandro Requejo Tovar</i>	

Chapter 24 · TV2 Danmark

The Origin of State Resources: Awaiting the Court’s Ruling in Case C-656/15 P <i>European Commission v TV2/Danmark A/S</i> ^{*2017}	560
<i>Mihalis Keklekis</i>	

Chapter 25 · Ryanair v Commission

Appeal against Alitalia State Aid Decisions by Ryanair Dismissed	570
<i>John Milligan and Luke Sales</i>	
Case C-287/12 P, <i>Ryanair v. Commission</i>: a Tale of Lost Opportunity ^{*2017}	584
<i>Elisabetta Righini</i>	

Chapter 26 · Deutsche Lufthansa

Binding Effect of Opening Decisions – <i>Lufthansa AG v FFH</i>	604
<i>Lucyne Ghazarian</i>	
The Obligations of National Courts after an Opening Decision ^{*2017}	616
<i>Lucyne Ghazarian and Christian Koenig</i>	

Chapter 27 · Ciudad de la Luz

Public Investment in a Cinema Studio and State Aid Rules: The Last Showing	624
<i>Marianne Clayton, María J. Segura, Egill D. Ólafsson</i>	
Ciudad de la Luz Judgment – An In-Depth Review of the Market Economy Investor Principle ^{*2017}	641
<i>Adina Claici</i>	

Chapter 28 · ING

Testing the Soundness of the Commission's Practice on State Aid to the Financial Sector	652
<i>Jose Manuel Panero Rivas</i>	
The ING Case^{*2017}	666
<i>Piet Jan Slot</i>	

Chapter 29 · Eventech

Eventech, the Selectivity of a Bus Lines Policy^{*2017}	680
<i>Laura Parret and Greetje van Heezik</i>	

Chapter 30 · Mediaset

It May Be Zero! CJEU Highlights National Courts' Authority to Review and Determine Amounts of Aid to Be Recovered	694
<i>Nina Niejahr</i>	
Mediaset III: The Recovery Revolution Deactivated^{*2017}	703
<i>Massimo Merola</i>	

Chapter 31 · Klausner Holz

State Aid as a Defence for Public Authorities?	718
<i>Grith Skovgaard Ølykke</i>	
Annotation on the Judgment C-505/14	
<i>Klausner Holz Niedersachsen v Land Nordrhein-Westfalen^{*2017}</i>	727
<i>Péter Staviczky</i>	

Chapter 32 · World Duty Free Group

Bury Them Deep: The Court of Justice Annuls the Autogrill and Banco Santander Judgments of the General Court	740
<i>Adrien Giraud and Sylvain Petit</i>	
Joined Cases C-20/15 P and C-21/15 P, European Commission v World Duty Free Group SA, Banco Santander SA and Santusa Holding SL^{*2017}	750
<i>Conor Quigley QC</i>	

* Case revisited in 2017.