Chaudfontaine Group Seminar 2015

Sensitive trade control and sanctions: implementing embargoes and penalties in case of violations

Ilaria Anna Colussi, University of Liège
In general → sanction is the reaction for the violation of a rule

In trade context → 2 categories:

1. “INTERNAL” SANCTIONS (within trade): penalties for the violation of export control regimes

2. “EXTERNAL” SANCTIONS: economic measures for achieving policy/political purposes
“INTERNAL” SANCTIONS (1)

mainly triggered at national level

- Sender: national States;
- Target: individuals/enterprises violating export control rules;
- Purpose: punitive/deterrent;
- Nature:
  • Administrative;
  • Criminal; and
  • Civil.
At the international level:

a) Legally binding → NPT, BWC, CWC, UN resolutions (57/66 of 2002, 1540/2004)

b) Politically binding → export control regimes

Both the frameworks invite States to introduce measures for cases of violation of export control rules
At the EU level:

- Regulation 428/2009 (dual use regulation)
- Regulation 258/2012 (establishing export authorization, and import and transit measures for firearms and related items)
- Regulation 1236/2005 (concerning trade in certain goods which could be used for capital punishment and torture)

do not indicate specific penalties, but affirm that each State shall lay down rules on penalties in case of infringement
“EXTERNAL” SANCTIONS (1)

International, regional (EU) and national level

- Sender:
  - International community
  - Regional systems (EU)
  - National States

- Target:
  - States (comprehensive sanctions)
  - individuals/enterprises (targeted sanctions)

- Purpose: political/policy change

- Nature:
  - Trade: embargo (general or specific)
  - Financial: asset freeze
  - Transport: visa/travel bans
“EXTERNAL” SANCTIONS (2)

INTERNATIONAL SANCTIONS:

- UN Charter, Chapter VII (in particular art. 41): sanctions through UNSC Resolutions (unanimously adopted), provided that there is a threat to peace and security;
- binding on all UN Member States: implementation left to States (art. 48);
- Types: general embargoes, Arms embargoes, asset freeze, travel bans
- Measures towards countries or targeted individuals
- SC Sanctions Commitee/Panel of Experts (UN subsidiary body) for the monitoring of the implementation of sanction resolutions
“EXTERNAL” SANCTIONS (3)

EU SANCTIONS:
Restrictive measures adopted in the framework of the CFSP:
- The cut across the horizontal (between EU institutions) and vertical (between Eu and Member States) division of competences;
- Different decision making procedures and legal instruments;
- EU implementing UNSC sanctions or autonomous ones (but “in conformity with international law”)

---

European Studies Unit
ESU

Faculty of Law and Political Science
COMPLEX PROCEDURE: EU INSTITUTIONS INVOLVED

Proposal:
- Member States
- EEAS
- HR
- HR + Commission

Adoption by the Council Decision (unanimity) under art. 29 TEU
(informing the Parliament)

Submission of the proposal to COREPER and Council

Political discussion in Regional Working Party of the Council

Technical discussion in the Council’s Foreign Relations Counsellors Working Party (RELEX)

Council’s RELEX: monitoring role

ECJ: judicial review (substantive as well)
IMPLEMENTATION: TWO-TRACKS PROCEDURE

Implementation of Council Decisions

General embargo and financial measures: **EU Regulation** (art. 215 TFEU)
- proposal: HR and Commission
- Analysis by RELEX and COREPER
- Adoption: Council (qualified majority)

States MAY adopt secondary sanctions

Arms embargo and travel bans: **direct implementation by States**
- States’ duty to notify the Commission on the measures adopted
- Possibility of infringement procedure
An example: Russia

- **Assets freeze and visa bans** upon individuals and entities threatening Ukraine’s sovereignty: **Council Decision** 145/2014/CFSP (measures extended until 15.03.2016) → implementation by MS

- **Restrictions for Crimea and Sevastopol**: prohibitions on imports from these areas, no investments, no export of certain goods to these areas: **Council Decision** 386/2014/CFSP followed by **Regulations** 692/2014 and 1351/2014 (measures extended until 23.06.2016)

NATIONAL SANCTIONS:
- imposed by a country towards another one, as a matter of foreign security policy (unilateral sanctions)
- they may supplement UNSC sanctions, or be autonomous from them
- implementing EU sanctions (both the Council decisions and the EU regulations): “effective, dissuasive, proportionate measures”
CONCLUSION

- sanctions: “multilevel” system, involving different political and legal actors;
- political/economic/social effects: positive, negative and unexpected effects…
Are sanctions effective, and represent really an evolution in the trade context?
Thanks for your attention!

For further information:
ilariaanna.colussi@ulg.ac.be

www.europeanstudiesunit.eu